

Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

By Craig M White
Version 2.2

"A nation [or Church] that forgets its past has no future" (Winston Churchill)

After the passing of the Apostles, did the Church of God consistently adhere to all of the original doctrines?
Where doctrines changed? Did error creep in or were they always doctrinally pure?



Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

Authored by Craig Martin White.

Copyright © Craig Martin White, GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001.

All Rights Reserved.

This work is promoted through History Research Foundation (USA), History Research Projects (Australia) and Friends of the Sabbath (Australia)

www.friendsofsabbath.org

No part of this work may be edited. It may be freely shared as part of research, projects or for educational purposes as long as quotes are properly cited.

Contents

Contents.....	3
Introductory Remarks	6
Chart. Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century	7
Concluding Remarks	14
References and Additional Reading	16
Appendix. Internet Research	18
Clean and Unclean Meats	18
Tithing.....	20
Deaconesses	23
Water Baptism by Immersion.....	26
Laying on of Hands for Healing and Ordination.....	29
The New Birth occurring at the Resurrection	33
The Importance of Israel.....	37
Non-Trinitarian Beliefs.....	42
Wednesday Crucifixion	45
Mortality of the Soul.....	49
Divinisation.....	53
Endnotes	58

History Research Projects

GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001

www.friendsofsabbath.org

www.hwalibrary.org

No limitation is placed upon reproduction of this document except that it must be reproduced in its entirety without modification or deletions. The publisher's name and address, copyright notice and this message must be included. It may be freely distributed but must be distributed without charge to the recipient.

Our purpose and desire is to foster Biblical, historical and related studies that strengthen the Church of God's message & mission and provides further support to its traditional doctrinal positions.

Other articles and charts in this series:

- *Amazing Temple Symbolism found in Revelation chapter 3!*
- *Collection of Notes on Church of God Groups*
- *Greenberry George Rupert. A Significant Church of God Leader*
- *Greenberry George Rupert. Man of God*
- *Herbert W Armstrong. Man of God*
- *Herman L Hoeh. Salute to a WCG Pioneer*
- *Historic Church of God Fundamentals of Belief. Tracking the Development of Core Doctrines*
- *History of the Fair Chance Doctrine*
- *Holy Day observances since the First Century*
- *Just what do you mean 'Laodicean Church'?*
- *Notes on the History of Passover Observance amongst Sabbatarians since the 18th Century*
- *Pioneers of the Worldwide Church of God*
- *Research Notes on the Eastern Churches*
- *Sabbatarian Groups: A scattered and little flock*
- *Seven Eras of Ancient Israel. Type of the Eras of the True Church?*
- *Seven Restorations of the Work*
- *Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God*
- *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God since the Nineteenth Century*
- *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups (c1800-c1860)*
- *Worldwide Church of God Pioneer Timelines*

Suggested reading:

- *A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine* by G Dellinger
- *Research Notes on the Eastern Churches* by C White
- *Historic Church of God Fundamentals of Belief. Tracking the Development of Core Doctrines* by C White
- *History of the Seventh Day Church of God (vols 1 & 2)* by R C Nickels
- *Holy Day observances since the First Century* by C White
- *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God since the Nineteenth Century* by C White
- *The Sabbath in History* by J Colheart

Introductory Remarks

Following on from various articles and charts tracing the history of Sabbatarian groups, whether the holy days have been observed over the centuries and also the fundamental beliefs of these groups from the 18th century, I thought it was high time to make an attempt to assemble the information I have on the various major doctrines of these groups.

Being truthful with history and accepting of historical facts is paramount and essential. We know that these groups kept the 10 Commandments and observed the Sabbath. In fact, honest historians declare that they (or many of them) continued to observe the holy days.¹

The doctrines of the Sabbatarian groups listed in the chart below do not include all of the obvious identifiers such as:

- 10 Commandments and Laws of God
- Sabbath
- Holy Days
- Divinity of Christ (or at least His Sonship)
- Clean and unclean foods
- Non-trinitarian
- Virgin birth of Christ
- Water baptism
- Second coming of Christ
- Millennium and the reign of the Kingdom of God on earth
- Resurrection of the righteous and sinners in separate resurrections
- Eternal Judgment
- Mortality of man and annihilation of the wicked
- Fruit of the spirit
- Beatitudes
- Repentance, faith, forgiveness and such like
- Opposition to worldly festivals such as Christmas, Easter etc
- Eldership not priesthood
- Opposition to idols and Popery
- Non-involvement in war and military service

It is difficult to ascertain how detailed their knowledge was in areas such as the Millennium, but this and other truths were taught.

At other times false doctrines would have crept in as they always do, but that does not necessarily negate them as Christians.

This research seeks to find other doctrinal positions in addition to the above such as the nature of God, born again, clean and unclean meats and observance to various other Laws (in addition to the Sabbath and Holy Days), church structure/governance/eldership, a fair chance of salvation for all and such like.

Over time, I shall fill in the gaps as I am able – given that most of my resources are in storage. However, some internet research is contained in the Appendix. Internet Research.

NB: not all sabbatarian groups are ‘kosher’ – that is true today as it was back then. Today some are virtually protestant; others almost Jewish; a few have bizarre beliefs; and there are those that are an utter disgrace as they are cultic and abusive. As we ‘see through a glass darkly,’ I cannot make a judgment in many cases as to which sabbatarian groups are legitimate and which I not. I merely list some of their distinctive doctrines which the mainstream did not adhere to at that time.

Chart. Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
First	Early Church	All the Biblical doctrines were taught.	The emphasis would have been different it would seem to us today
Second	Polycarp	Indication was that he held to the Binitarian view of the Godhead.	
	Theophilus of Antioch	He believed in divinisation. ² Believed in a sort of Binitarianism or semi-Arianism. ³	Seemed to have been a Sabbatarian leader
	Nazarenes	Godhead doctrine – they were Binitarian ⁴ Believed the millennium and also in 3 resurrections ⁵ as well as the restoration of Israel. ⁶ “Nazarenes, an obscure Jewish-Christian sect, existing at the time of Epiphanius (fl. A.D. 370) in Coele-Syria, Decapolis (Pella) and Basanitus (Cocabe)...they dated	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		their settlement in Pella from the time of the flight of the Jewish Christians from Jerusalem, immediately before the siege in A.D. 70;... [this writer characterizes them as] more or less than Jews pure and simple but adds that they recognized the new covenant as well as the old, and believed in the resurrection, and in the one God and His Son Jesus Christ. ...while adhering as far as possible to the Mosaic economy as regarded...sabbaths, foods , and the like, they did not refuse to recognize the apostolicity of Paul.” ⁷	
Third	Nazarenes	As above	
Fourth	Nazarenes	As above “In the fourth century, Emperor Constantine commanded that Christians in Jerusalem who would not eat pork were to be killed.” ⁸ “Manichean Faustus, {in} the fourth century ... complained. “Such people practice circumcision, keep the Sabbath, then shun swine’s meat and other things like that, all according to the Law. And yet they still claim to be Christians”.” ⁹	
	Ebionites	As above but also believed in circumcision, that Christ was merely human (ie adoptionism) and some had an animosity toward Paul. ¹⁰	Obviously they were a heretical group
Fifth	Nazarenes	As above	
Sixth	Nazarenes	As above	
Seventh	Paulicians of Armenia	A branch of the Paulician grouping in Phrygia was known as the <i>Athinganoi</i> . This group observed " observed all the laws of Moses , though refraining from circumcision on the one hand, and practicing Christian baptism on the other...," ¹¹ The also did not believe in the immortality of the soul and were against the wearing of the cross and were also opposed to ‘holy pictures’. ¹²	Apparently, they were unitarians
Eighth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	
Ninth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
Tenth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	
Eleventh	Pasagini of Lombardy	"... the sect of the Pasagini. They say that Christ is the first and a pure created being and that the Old Testament is to be observed in the matter of feasts, circumcision, choice of foods , and in almost all other respects, with the exception of sacrifices" ¹³	This appears to be Arianism or perhaps semi-Arianism
Twelve	Pasagini of Lombardy	"The eighteenth-century Church historian [Lutheran] Mosheim mentions the Pasagini (or Pasagii) of Lombardy who were distinct on account of their teaching that the law of Moses should be kept in all details except the offering of sacrifices, and their Arian views on the nature of Christ . With regard to the former, they were sometimes known as Circumcisii since they practised circumcision . Mosheim notes that they also abstained from unclean meats prohibited by the Mosaic law." ¹⁴	
Thirteenth	Pasagini	"They observed the law of Moses (except as to sacrifices), circumcision , the Sabbath, distinction of clean and unclean foods all forming part of their system...the Passagians appealed to the scriptures of the Old and New Testaments in support of their doctrine." ¹⁵ They practiced circumcision and observed clean & unclean meats. ¹⁶	
Fourteenth	Various	John Seygno advocated the doctrine of pigs being unclean meat and not for human consumption. ¹⁷	
Fifteenth	Waldenses Hungarian Sabbatarians	Equated RCC priests with Babylon, little horn of Daniel, the Great Whore of Revelation ¹⁸ NB: only a few Waldenses observed the Sabbath day ¹⁹ "The foregoing summary shows what position the Jewish festivals occupied in the ritual of the Sabbatarians. They kept, of course, only the festivals enjoined in the Pentateuch, for the Sabbatarians of the first period only recognised the Five Books of Moses as the religious law to which they were pledged. They did not celebrate Purim and Chanukah. But even the Mosaic Laws they did not observe in their entirety, for they kept the dietary laws only up to a certain limit, and circumcision not at all. The Sabbath played the most important part in their religious life ..." ²⁰	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
Sixteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	<p>Richard Nickels summarized their beliefs as such:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The Passover, Days of Unleavened Bread, Pentecost, Day of Atonement, Feast of Tabernacles, The Last Great Day. During the Passover season, no leavened bread was eaten. Obviously, Easter, New Year, Christmas and Sunday were rejected as days invented by Rome. They also adhered to the Sacred Calendar. 2) The Ten Commandments. 3) The Health Laws (no eating of blood, pig, strangled animals etc.) 4) The Millennium, to last 1000 years, at the beginning of which Christ will return and regather both Judah and Israel. 5) The use of God's Sacred Calendar. (Taught against Gregorian, Roman calendar.) 6) Two different Resurrections; one to eternal life at Christ's coming; the other to judgement at the end of 1000 years. 7) Saved by Grace, but laws still need to be kept. 8) It is God who calls people into His Truth. The world in general is blinded. The truth is not generally revealed to the mighty, but to the small, insignificant. 9) Christ was the greatest of the prophets, the most holy of all the people, the Crucified Lord, the Supreme Head and King of the real believers, the dearly beloved and Holy Son of God. (Note! After Eossi's death, some Sabbath-keepers began to look upon Christ as a holy man, but not as the divine God or even the divine Son of God in the strictest sense.) 10) Christ upon His return, will take over David's throne. 11) Pictures of Christ and God were considered idolatrous. 12) The New Covenant is only partly fulfilled now in those now called. 13) Disbelief in the Original Sin idea. 14) Disbelief in predestination as taught by Calvin. Instead, every person is a free moral agent. 15) Luther, Calvin and the Pope were considered "abominations."²¹ 	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
Seventeenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	<p>“Sabbatarians were easy target of the new discriminatory law: they observed the Sabbath, therefore they farmed on Sundays, abstained from eating pork and blood, celebrated the Passover with unleavened bread, and refused baptism of their children--the very sign of their expected conversion.”²²</p> <p>Many practised circumcision under Andreas Fischer, though another sabbatarian leader and associate, Oswald Glaidt, did not.²³</p>	
	John Traske	<p>“At the same time, English Puritans were probably the first to teach that Jesus was none other than YHWH, the God of the Old Testament. Edward Stennet and John Spittlehouse called Christ Jehova Jesus in the 1650s. Anglican Francis Bampfield, a graduate of Oxford, and at one time prebend of Exeter Cathedral, wrote in his 1677 book <i>The Seventh Day Sabbath - The Desirable Day</i>, that “The LORD Jesus Christ, who is Redeemer, was Creator...Jehovah Christ as Mediator did himself at Mount Sinai proclaim the law of Ten Words.” His brother, Thomas Bampfield, also held in 1692 that Jesus Christ, the Jehovah of the Old Testament, instituted the Sabbath in the beginning in <i>An enquiry whether the Lord Jesus Christ made the world, and be Jehovah, and gave the moral law? and whether the fourth command be repealed or altered?</i> Thomas had been Speaker of the House of Commons in 1659.”²⁴</p> <p>Traske was also opposed to eating pork and taught against it.²⁵ He subscribed to all the Levitical dietary laws forbidding the consumption of blood and swine ... the Passover [and the] Sabbath.”²⁶</p> <p>“Around 1615, Traske started a one-way correspondence with the King himself, urging him to condemn “Rome and the Jesuits.”^{27, 28}</p>	<p>“The example chosen is one of the most extreme and “heretical” from the early seventeenth century, that of John Traske, initially a Church of England minister, who in 1618 was imprisoned for starting a movement which ostentatiously adopted judaizing ceremonial practices...</p> <p>It would perhaps be more accurate to study the “Traskites,” as they came to be known, from the perspective of the so-called “Judaizing turn” of seventeenth-century England, which was recorded a generation ago by the likes of David S. Katz: the Hebrew revival, the eschatological hopes about locating the lost Ten Tribes of Israel and the subsequent restoration of the Jews to the land of Israel, and in the realms of philosophy and political theory, both in England and in Holland, the rise of scepticism, the consolidation of anti-trinitarianism.”²⁹</p>

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
			The Sabbatarians at that time fell within the label of puritanism which “was a large umbrella under which many guises and incarnations may have been able to grow.” ³⁰ A bit like the Churches of God today sometimes confused with Adventism.
	Thomas Totney	<p>Totney was a noted Sabbatarian who believed that the Saxons were traceable back to the Biblical Israel: “The ‘Noble Saxon line,’ meanwhile, could be traced back to Biblical Israel, through: Media, Persian and Egypt; then into Captivity by Titus Vespasian, and so to Rome, from Rome to France in Charlemagne, from that descent to Henry the seventh. [quoting Tany, <i>Theauraujohn His Aurora</i>, 27). ... The Saxons ... appear in the mode of Biblical Israel: noble, Godly and persecuted ... Ethnicity is grounded in ethics. Tyranny is associated with miscegenation.” (p. 183) Thomas Totney referred to himself “as a Jew [ie Israelite] of the tribe of Reuben” (p. 161) and he “traced his lineage back to ancient Israel.”³¹ (p. 188)</p>	
	Dr David Chamberlen	<p>Believed in full water baptism (ie by immersion), footwashing and was anti-Trinity.³² Chamberlen even wrote to Archbishop Sheldon concerning "the Little Triple Crowned Horn's Change of Times and Lawes," mentioning at the same time, "Escape the Mark of the Beast: & Return to the Keeping of the Lawes of God."³³</p>	John Maulden (a Sabbatarian leader) also held to footwashing and an annual Lord's Supper (Passover). ³⁴
	Sabbatarian Church of Christ	Believed that “there is but one God the Father of whom are all things and One Lord Jesus Christ by whom are all things. And that we rely upon “God in his only begotten Son Christ Jesus for pardon & eternal life.” ³⁵	Based in Westerly and Hopkinson. This seems to be an Arian belief or semi-binitarianism.
Eighteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians Other	As above	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		Some taught against consuming unclean meats in England and also taught that Passover should be observed on 14 Abib. ³⁶	
Nineteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	As above	
	Seventh Day Baptists	Many associated Sabbatarians believed in Arianism ³⁷ , Wednesday crucifixion ³⁸ and washing of feet ³⁹	"I conclude they all believe in one God, the Father and Maker of all things, sin excepted, and in one Lord Jesus Christ, or that Jesus Christ is the Son of God, and also in the Holy Ghost, as the operative power or spirit of God. But there are few if any, of this denomination, as I conceive, who believe that the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, are three absolute distinct persons, coequal, coessential, and coeternal Gods, and yet but one God ; as such an idea would be in the face of scripture, and repugnant to right reason." ⁴⁰
	Sabbatarians in West Virginia	"The Meats Issue. The doctrine of abstaining from unclean meats has long been an issue of dispute in the Church of God. A "Seventh-Day Baptist" church on the South Fork of the Hughes River in West Virginia which existed in the 1840's, 1850's, and 1860's was looked upon as somewhat of an oddity. It termed itself "the Church of Christ," observed the Passover once a year, was governed by the elders, and forbade the use of unclean meats. " ⁴¹	
	Church of God	In 1866 the <i>Hope of Israel</i> periodical published an article by Brinkerhoff linking the eating of pork with the disease of trichinosis. ⁴² RCC is Mystery Babylon, tithing, baptism, clean & unclean meats, born again in the resurrection, Wed crucifixion-Sat resurrection	Andrew N Dugger was also an exponent for the clean and unclean meats doctrine

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
	Greenberry G Rupert's Church group (Remnant of Israel)	Taught all the laws of God, tithing, baptism, church eras RCC is Mystery Babylon	
Twentieth	Churches of God (in general)	Tithing, baptism, clean & unclean meats, church eras, born again in the resurrection, Wed crucifixion-Sat resurrection, a resurrection of the Roman Empire etc	Pastor David Nield, for example, was residing in New Zealand when he wrote <i>Begotten Again, or Born Again – Which?</i> (1902, 15pp). He also promoted a Wednesday crucifixion and annual Passover. ⁴³

Concluding Remarks

When one views what information is available, it is clear that the stances by Sabbatarian groups on various positions changed and errors crept in. Sometimes officially and at other times 'under the radar.' For example, there have been different concepts of the Godhead by Sabbatarians. Also, one finds mention of the acceptance of circumcision from time-to-time. It is not easy to understand this: was it adult circumcision; or only for babies for hygienic reasons? On some occasions the supposed practice of circumcision was probably due to false reports by their enemies.

This does not mean that some incorrect ideas affected their salvation and we should not condemn them from our position in history. We had the blessings of the truths that came into the Church via our nineteenth century pioneers and others such as Andrew Dugger and especially Herbert W Armstrong – it is via the latter that so much greater depth was restored to the Church of God, based on the foundations he inherited.

In any event, these sabbatarian groups were part of different eras and didn't have the same depth and access to resources we have today. But they did the best they could with what they had. Today we have access to vast areas of knowledge they wouldn't have had a fraction of, such as history, archaeology, linguistics, enormous research on the tribes of Israel, chiasms, figures of speech, typology and such like which helps us in doctrinal formulation.

Knowledge is increasing in these last days – it is up to us to leverage off the good research of others while simultaneously sifting through the data and eschewing any errors found.

"But you, Daniel, shut up the words and seal the book, until the time of the end. Many shall run to and fro, and **knowledge shall increase.**"

(Daniel 12:4, ESV)

For instance, from the Church of God (seventh day) and associated groups, Herbert W Armstrong learned fundamental doctrines such as the 7th day Sabbath and basic Christian living principles (repentance, faith, fruits of the spirit, beatitudes etc). Also:

- Passover on 14 Abib
- Tithing
- Clean & unclean meats
- Millennium on earth
- Water baptism
- Holy spirit is a force, not a personage
- Wed Crucifixion-Sat Resurrection
- Man does not have an immortal soul
- Annihilation of the wicked
- The Christian reward is not heaven
- Healing
- Laying on of hands
- New birth culminates in the resurrection (the Church generally taught this into the 1940s)
- Seven resurrections of the Roman Empire (though not in much detail)
- Church eras etc (taught by Dugger and others)

Herbert Armstrong also began to observe the holy days with his wife from 1927. Other groups were already observing these days as were some individuals. It was in this context and environment that he arose and was able to undertake a vast Work where others were not able to do so.

Let us continue the tradition of digging deeper and deeper into the Truth, valuing adding and increasing to what has been restored. There is much to learn and much to gain from further research, utilising the works of specialists.

References and Additional Reading

Allix, P. (1690).	<i>Some Remarks upon the Ecclesiastical History of the Ancient churches of Piedmont</i> . Oxford at the Clarendon Press (reprint 1832).
Ambassador College. (1968).	<i>Ambassador College Bible Correspondence Course</i> , Lesson 52, “The Book and the Church They Couldn’t Destroy,” Worldwide Church of God, Pasadena, CA.
Bacher, W. (1890).	“The Sabbatarians of Hungary,” <i>The Jewish Quarterly Review</i> , Vol. 2, 1 July, p. 465-93.
Bagatti, B. C. (1971).	<i>The Church from the Circumcision. History and Archaeology of the Judaeo-Christians</i> (Collectio Minor 2). Jerusalem, rist. 1984, 2004. English translation by E. Hoade.
Baird, R. (1847).	<i>History of the Ancient Christians Inhabiting the Valley of the Alps</i> . Griffith and Simon, Philadelphia, PA.
Ball, B. W. (2009).	<i>Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800</i> . 2nd edition. James Clark & Co, Cambridge, UK.
Ball, B. W. (2015).	“The roots of English sabbatarianism.” In B. Ball, & R. McIver (Eds.), <i>Grounds for assurance and hope: Selected biblical and historical writings of Bryan W. Ball</i> (pp. 142-160). Avondale Academic Press, Cooranbong, Australia.
Benson, P. (c2015).	<i>Sabbatarian Churches of God in Rhode Island —Our Heritage</i> , http://www.unityinchrist.com/history/historycog1.htm
Blackwell, B. C. (2019).	https://dunelm.wordpress.com/2019/02/08/theophilus-of-antioch-and-theosis/ 8 Feb.
Blackwell, D. (1973).	<i>A Handbook of Church History</i> . (MA thesis) Ambassador College, Pasadena, CA.
Briggs, L. (1972).	<i>What Became of the Church Jesus Built?</i> Ambassador College, Pasadena, CA.
Clarke, H. (1811).	<i>A History of the Sabbatarians or Seventh Day Baptists in America</i> . Seward & Williams, New York, NY.
Conybeare, F. C. (1898).	<i>The Key of Truth: A Manual of the Paulician Church of Armenia</i> . Clarendon Press, Oxford.
Cook, W. (2013).	“The Ebionites: Eccentric or Essential Early Christians?” <i>Journal of Arts and Humanities</i> , Vol. 2, No. 7, Aug, pp. 15-22.
Cottrell-Boyce, A. (2021).	<i>Aidan, Jewish Christians in Puritan England</i> , Wipf Publishers, Eugene, OR.
Damsteegt, P. G. (2016).	“Decoding Waldensian Names: New Discoveries,” <i>Andrews University Seminary Studies</i> , Vol. 54, No. 2, pp. 237–258.
Dellinger, G. (1982)	<i>A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine</i> . Bible Research Center, Westfield, IN.
Dods, M. (1885).	“Theophilus of Antioch. To Autolyucus, Book II, Chapter XXII.” <i>Ante-Nicene Fathers</i> , Vol 2. Edited by Alexander Roberts & James Donaldson. American Edition.
Ehrman, B. D. (2003).	<i>Lost Christianities: The Battle for Scriptures and Faiths We Never Knew</i> . Oxford University Press, New York, NY.
Falconer, J. (1618).	<i>A briefe refutation of Iohn Traskes iudaical and nouel fancies Stiling himselfe Minister of Gods Word, imprisoned for the lawes eternall perfection, or God’s lawes perfect eternity</i> . English College Press.
Frederickson, P. (2018).	<i>When Christians Were Jews: The First Generation</i> . Yale University Press, New Haven, CT.
Froom, L. (1954).	<i>The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers</i> (vol. 4). Review & Herald Publishing, Washington, DC.

Garsoïan, N. G. (1967).	<i>The Paulician Heresy</i> . Mouton & Co, The Hague, Netherlands.
Gellérd, J. (2000).	"Spiritual Jews of Szekler Jerusalem," <i>Literature of Memory VI: Hope and Despair</i> , STH TS 870, Fall.
Herrmann, F. (2022).	"Antinomians, Ceremonialists, and Judaizers: on the Margins of Puritanism?" <i>French Journal of British Studies</i> , Vol. XXVII, No. 3, pp. 51-63.
Hook, M. (c.1980).	<i>Sequel to a Mutiny Early Adventism on Pitcairn Island</i> . South Pacific Division Department of Education, Wahroonga, Australia.
Howard, K. W. (1993).	<i>Jewish Christianity in the Early Church</i> . Honors Thesis in Church History. Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, VA.
Hurtado, L. W. (2003).	<i>Lord Jesus Christ, Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity</i> . William B. Eerdmans Publishing, Grand Rapids, MI.
Liechty, D. (1984).	"Andreas Fischer: A Brief Biographical Sketch," <i>The Mennonite Quarterly Review</i> , April, pp. 125-32.
Meyers, E. (1988).	"Early Judaism and Christianity in the Light of Archaeology," <i>Biblical Archaeologist</i> , June 1988, pp. 69-79.
Mosheim, J. L. (et al) (1842).	<i>An Ecclesiastical History, Ancient and Modern</i> . Vols. 1 & 2. Plaskitt & Cugle Baltimore, MD.
N.N. (1997).	<i>Are the Nazarenes and Ebionites the only True Christians?</i> http://christianthinktank.com/qnazonly.html
N.N. (2011).	"Whatever happened to the Hebrew Christians?" <i>The Economist</i> , 20 April.
Nickels, R. C. (1973, 1999).	<i>History of the Seventh Day Church of God</i> (Vol. 1). Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
Nickels, R. C. (1990s).	<i>Sabbatarians in Transylvania</i> http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html . Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
Nickels, R. C. (c2000).	<i>Sabbatarians of Transylvania</i> . Summary of the paper, <i>The Beliefs and Practices of the Church of God in Transylvania During the Middle Ages, 1588-1623</i> , by Gerhard O. Marx. http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html . Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
Rogers, D. (1970s).	<i>The Historic Phenomena and Theology of the Nazarenes and Ebionites</i> . USA
Starr, J. (1936).	"An Eastern Christian Sect: the Athinganoi," <i>The Harvard Theological Review</i> , Vol. xxix, No. 2, April, pp. 93-106.
Stump, K. (1994).	"The Origins of the Church of God's Oldest Publication — The Bible Advocate," <i>Reviews You Can Use</i> , Jan-Feb, pp. 15-20.
The Encyclopedia Britannica Company. (1911).	"Nazarenes," <i>The Encyclopedia Britannica</i> , Eleventh Edition, Vol. 19.
Wakefield, W. L. (1991). Evans, A. P.	<i>Heresies of the Middle Ages</i> . Columbia University Press, New York, NY.
Waldenses. (c1182).	<i>The Book of Antichrist</i> .
Ward, S. (1769).	<i>Confession of Faith</i> (5 August). Quoted in https://www.ucg.org/the-good-news/governor-samuel-ward-and-his-confession-of-faith
White, A. L. (1965).	<i>Ellen G. White Estate – Question and Answer File</i> . 13 May, Ellen G. White Publications.
White, W. (2008).	<i>The Roots of Our Belief</i> . Dynamic Christian Ministries, USA.
Wikipedia. (2019).	"Pasagians" https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians
Wikipedia. (2019).	<i>Collectio Rev. Occitan</i> in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers' <i>History of the Sects</i> , Vol. 2, p. 375. (Quoted in https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians)

Appendix. Internet Research

NB: These internet searches were helpful, but we have to accept that they are imperfect. The wording below is direct from the internet without any editing. More research is needed. For additional information, refer to the papers *Passover and Holy Day Observances since the First Century*; *Notes on the History of Passover Observance amongst Sabbatarians since the 18th Century*; and *Research Notes on the Eastern Churches* available for [free online here](#).

Appendix. Clean and Unclean Meats

Below is an itemized list of Seventh-day Christian groups known to observe biblical dietary laws (primarily those outlined in Leviticus 11 and Deuteronomy 14) from the 2nd to 19th centuries. These laws typically involve abstaining from unclean meats (e.g., pork, shellfish) and consuming only clean animals (e.g., those with cloven hooves that chew the cud, fish with scales and fins). The list is limited by the historical record, as few Christian groups explicitly emphasized Old Testament dietary laws during this period, and even fewer were distinctly "Seventh-day" (Sabbath-observing on Saturday). I've included relevant groups with available evidence, noting that some groups may not have been strictly "Seventh-day" in the modern sense but observed both the Sabbath and dietary laws. Each entry includes a brief description and bibliographic citations to primary or scholarly sources where possible.

Itemized List of Seventh-day Christian Groups Observing Biblical Dietary Laws (2nd to 19th Centuries)

1. Ebionites (2nd–4th Centuries)

- **Description:** The Ebionites were an early Jewish-Christian sect that adhered to the Mosaic Law, including dietary restrictions and Sabbath observance. They followed the Torah's dietary laws, avoiding unclean meats as prescribed in Leviticus 11, and maintained Jewish practices while accepting Jesus as the Messiah. Their adherence to these laws was rooted in their belief in the continuity of the Torah for Christian practice.
- **Evidence:** Historical records from early Church Fathers indicate their strict adherence to Jewish dietary laws.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Epiphanius of Salamis, *Panarion* (c. 375 CE), Book 30. Translated by Frank Williams, *The Panarion of Epiphanius of Salamis* (Leiden: Brill, 1994). Describes the Ebionites' adherence to Mosaic dietary laws and Sabbath observance.
 - Ehrman, Bart D., *Lost Christianities: The Battles for Scripture and the Faiths We Never Knew* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003), pp. 99–103. Discusses Ebionite practices, including dietary laws.

2. Nazarenes (2nd–5th Centuries)

- **Description:** The Nazarenes, another Jewish-Christian group, observed the Sabbath and adhered to the Torah's dietary laws, distinguishing themselves from mainstream Gentile Christianity. They viewed the dietary laws as part of their commitment to holiness and separation from pagan practices.
- **Evidence:** Early Christian writers note their adherence to Jewish customs, including kosher dietary practices, alongside Sabbath-keeping.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Jerome, *On Isaiah* (c. 410 CE), Book 8. Translated in *The Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, Series II, Vol. 6* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1996). Mentions Nazarene adherence to Jewish law, including dietary restrictions.
 - Pritz, Ray A., *Nazarene Jewish Christianity: From the End of the New Testament Period Until Its Disappearance in the Fourth Century* (Leiden: Brill, 1988), pp. 45–50. Details Nazarene observance of dietary laws and Sabbath.

3. Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church (4th Century–Present)

- **Description:** While not exclusively a "Seventh-day" group in the modern Adventist sense, the Ethiopian Orthodox Church has historically observed the seventh-day Sabbath alongside Sunday and followed dietary practices with similarities to Jewish kosher laws, such as avoiding pork and shellfish. Their rituals, including animal slaughter, show connections to Jewish shechitah practices.
- **Evidence:** The church's practices are documented in historical and liturgical texts, emphasizing dietary restrictions and Sabbath observance.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Ullendorff, Edward, *Ethiopia and the Bible* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1968), pp. 97–100. Discusses the Ethiopian Church's dietary practices and Sabbath observance.
 - *Wikipedia*, "Christian Dietary Laws" (2014), accessed via. Notes the Ethiopian Orthodox Church's dietary restrictions resembling Jewish kosher laws.

4. Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century–19th Century)

- **Description:** Emerging in England in the mid-17th century, Seventh Day Baptists observed the seventh-day Sabbath and, in some cases, followed biblical dietary laws, particularly in their early years. While not all congregations strictly adhered to Leviticus 11, some members avoided unclean meats, influenced by their emphasis on Old Testament principles.
- **Evidence:** Historical records of Seventh Day Baptist communities in England and America suggest dietary observance among certain congregations, though it was not universally enforced.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Sanford, Don A., *A Choosing People: The History of Seventh Day Baptists* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1992), pp. 35–40. Mentions dietary practices among early Seventh Day Baptists.

- Chukwuma, Onyekachi G., “Old Testament Dietary Laws in Contemporary African Christian Practice,” *Scielo.org.za* (2022), accessed via. Notes Seventh Day Baptists’ strict observance of Old Testament dietary laws.

5. Church of God (Seventh Day) Precursors (19th Century)

- **Description:** In the 19th century, some Sabbatarian groups that later influenced the Church of God (Seventh Day) observed biblical dietary laws alongside the seventh-day Sabbath. These groups, emerging from the Millerite movement, emphasized a return to biblical practices, including dietary restrictions from Leviticus 11.
- **Evidence:** Early writings from these groups show a focus on clean and unclean meats, particularly among those who joined the Adventist movement before the formal establishment of the Seventh-day Adventist Church.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Coulter, Robert, *The Journey: A History of the Church of God (Seventh Day)* (Denver: Church of God Publishing House, 1986), pp. 15–20. Discusses early Sabbatarian groups’ dietary practices.
 - *Adventist Today*, “*The Real Reason for Religious Food Rules*” (2020), accessed via. Notes dietary law observance among early Sabbatarian Adventists.

Notes:

- **Limited Evidence:** The historical record for Seventh-day Christian groups observing biblical dietary laws is sparse between the 5th and 17th centuries due to the dominance of mainstream Christian practices that largely rejected Old Testament dietary laws, as seen in sources like the *Letter to Diognetus* and *Epistle of Barnabas* (). The Ebionites and Nazarenes are notable early exceptions, but their influence waned by the 5th century.
- **Context of Sabbath Observance:** Many groups listed were not “Seventh-day” in the modern denominational sense (e.g., Seventh-day Adventists, formalized in 1863) but observed the Sabbath alongside dietary laws, making them relevant to the query.
- **Dietary Law Interpretation:** Some groups, like the Ethiopian Orthodox, adapted dietary practices to their cultural context, which may not strictly align with Leviticus 11 but reflect a similar intent.
- **Primary Sources:** Where possible, I’ve cited primary sources (e.g., Epiphanius, Jerome) or scholarly works. Secondary sources like Wikipedia () and Scielo () are used cautiously to corroborate primary evidence.

Appendix. Tithing

Below is an itemized list of Seventh-day Christian groups known to observe tithing from the 2nd to 19th centuries, based on available historical evidence. The Seventh-day Adventist Church, formally established in 1863, is the primary group associated with seventh-day observance and tithing in this period. Other groups with seventh-day practices, such as certain Sabbatarian sects, have limited documentation regarding tithing, especially prior to the 19th

century. The list focuses on groups with verifiable practices and includes bibliographic citations for reference. Given the specificity of the query, the evidence is sparse for earlier centuries, as seventh-day observance was not widespread among Christians until the 19th century, and tithing practices were often not explicitly documented for these groups.

Itemized List of Seventh-day Christian Groups Observing Tithing (2nd to 19th Centuries)

1. Seventh-day Adventist Church (19th Century)

- **Description:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church, formally organized in 1863 in the United States, is a Protestant Christian denomination distinguished by its observance of Saturday as the Sabbath and its emphasis on tithing. Tithing is a core doctrine, with members encouraged to return one-tenth of their income to support the church's ministry, based on biblical principles such as Malachi 3:10 and Deuteronomy 16:17. The church's tithing system is rooted in the Old Testament practice of the sacred tithe, adapted for New Testament believers under the priesthood of Melchizedek.
- **Evidence of Tithing:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual explicitly states that members are encouraged to faithfully return a tithe (10% of their increase or personal income) to the denomination's treasury for the support of gospel ministers and church activities. Ellen G. White, a co-founder, emphasized tithing as a spiritual discipline, stating, "The tithe should go to those who labor in word and doctrine, be they men or women" (Counsels on Stewardship, 1940). Tithing was practiced consistently from the church's formation in the 1860s onward.
- **Historical Context:** The church emerged from the Millerite movement of the 1840s, which did not have a formalized tithing system. By the 1870s, the Adventists had established a structured tithing practice, influenced by Old Testament models and the need to fund missionary work and church institutions.
- **Citation:**
 - General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual*, 19th ed. (Hagerstown, Md.: Review and Herald Pub. Assn., 2015), p. 169.
 - Ellen G. White, *Counsels on Stewardship* (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Pub. Assn., 1940), p. 101.
 - C. G. Tuland, "The Three Tithes of the Old Testament," *Ministry Magazine*, [www.ministrymagazine.org.\[\]\(https://www.ministrymagazine.org/archive/1958/09/the-three-tithes-of-the-old-testament\)](https://www.ministrymagazine.org/archive/1958/09/the-three-tithes-of-the-old-testament)

2. Church of God (Seventh Day) (19th Century)

- **Description:** The Church of God (Seventh Day), a Sabbatarian group that also emerged from the Millerite movement in the mid-19th century, is another seventh-day Christian group with roots in the same era as the Seventh-day Adventists. This group formally organized in the 1860s and shares similar beliefs, including Saturday Sabbath observance.
- **Evidence of Tithing:** While less documented than the Seventh-day Adventist Church, the Church of God (Seventh Day) adopted tithing as a practice to support its ministry, drawing from the same biblical framework (e.g., Genesis 14:18-20, Malachi 3:10). Historical records suggest

that tithing was encouraged among members to fund church operations, though the practice was not as centralized or systematized as in the Seventh-day Adventist Church.

- **Historical Context:** The Church of God (Seventh Day) split from the broader Adventist movement in the 1860s over theological differences, including the role of Ellen G. White’s writings. Tithing was likely influenced by the same restorationist impulse that shaped Adventist practices, emphasizing a return to biblical principles. Documentation is limited, but tithing was noted as a voluntary practice among members by the late 19th century.
- **Citation:**
 - Richard C. Nickels, *History of the Seventh Day Church of God* (Neck City, Mo.: Giving & Sharing, 1988), pp. 45-47. [Note: This source is not part of the provided web results but is a standard reference for the history of this group.]
 - “Tithing,” *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, www.britannica.com, published March 3, 2025. (Confirms tithing as a requirement in some seventh-day churches, including Sabbatarian groups).

3. Other Sabbatarian Groups (Pre-19th Century)

- **Description:** Prior to the 19th century, seventh-day Christian groups were rare, with most Sabbatarian practices found among Jewish Christians or isolated sects like the Waldenses (a proto-Protestant group active from the 12th century). The Waldenses, while not exclusively seventh-day, occasionally observed the Saturday Sabbath and were known to oppose mandatory tithing imposed by the Roman Catholic Church.
- **Evidence of Tithing:** There is little direct evidence that pre-19th century seventh-day groups consistently practiced tithing. The Waldenses, for example, rejected the ecclesiastical tithing laws of the Catholic Church, favoring voluntary giving based on New Testament principles (e.g., 2 Corinthians 9:7). Some scholars suggest that seventh-day Jewish Christian communities in the early centuries (2nd–4th centuries) may have followed Jewish tithing practices (ma’aser), but this is speculative due to the lack of surviving records.
- **Historical Context:** Tithing in the early Christian church was not universally mandated until the 6th century, when ecclesiastical law required it (Council of Mâcon, 585 CE). Seventh-day groups, being marginal, likely adopted voluntary giving rather than formal tithing, especially as they resisted Catholic authority. No specific seventh-day group from the 2nd to 18th centuries is documented as having a structured tithing system.
- **Citation:**
 - David Croteau, “The History of Tithing,” *Go to Heaven Now!*, www.gotoheavennow.com, published March 3, 2020. (Notes opposition to tithing by groups like the Waldenses).
 - “Tithe,” *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, www.britannica.com, published March 3, 2025. (Discusses tithing’s development and lack of universal adoption in early Christianity).

Notes and Limitations

- **Sparse Evidence Pre-19th Century:** Seventh-day Christian groups were not prominent before the 19th century, and tithing practices are poorly documented for such groups. Most Christian tithing in this period was tied to the Roman Catholic or Anglican churches, which enforced tithing through ecclesiastical or secular law, often opposed by dissenting groups like Sabbatarians.
- **Focus on 19th Century:** The rise of the Millerite movement and subsequent formation of seventh-day groups like the Seventh-day Adventists and Church of God (Seventh Day) in the 19th century provides the clearest evidence of tithing among seventh-day Christians.
- **Source Constraints:** The provided web results offer limited details on pre-19th century seventh-day groups, and secondary sources (e.g., Nickels' history) are referenced where necessary to supplement the record.
- **Critical Examination:** The establishment narrative, as reflected in sources like *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, may overemphasize the continuity of tithing from Old Testament to Christian practice. Dissenting voices, such as the Waldenses or early church figures like Epiphanius, suggest tithing was not universally accepted, especially among non-mainstream groups.

If you require further details or additional research into specific centuries or groups, please let me know, and I can conduct a deeper analysis or search for more primary sources.

Appendix. Deaconesses

There is limited historical evidence specifically identifying Seventh-day Christian groups (those observing the Sabbath on Saturday) with deaconesses between the 2nd and 19th centuries, as the formal establishment of denominations like the Seventh-day Adventists or Seventh Day Baptists, which are prominent today, occurred later, primarily in the 19th century. Additionally, the role of deaconesses in Christian history varies across denominations, and the term "Seventh-day Christian" is not consistently applied to specific groups before the modern era. Below, I provide an itemized list focusing on groups with a Sabbath-keeping tradition or those explicitly identified as having deaconesses, based on available historical data. The list draws on relevant sources, acknowledging that Sabbath-keeping groups were not always distinctly labeled as "Seventh-day" until later centuries.

Itemized List of Seventh-day Christian Groups with Deaconesses (2nd to 19th Centuries)

1. **Early Christian Communities (2nd–4th Centuries, Eastern Churches with Sabbath Influences)**
 - **Description:** While not explicitly "Seventh-day" in the modern denominational sense, some early Christian communities in the Eastern Roman Empire, particularly in regions like Asia Minor and Syria, maintained Sabbath practices alongside Sunday worship and had deaconesses. These groups are noted in early Christian texts for their roles in assisting women during baptisms and ministering to the sick and poor. The *Didascalia Apostolorum* (3rd century, Syria) describes deaconesses as essential for women's ministry, including baptismal preparation and home visits, in communities that may have included Sabbath-observing Jewish Christians.

- **Evidence of Deaconesses:** The *Didascalia Apostolorum* explicitly instructs bishops to appoint deaconesses for women’s ministry, stating, “Therefore, O bishop, appoint yourself workers of righteousness, helpers who cooperate with you unto life... a woman for the ministry of women” (Didascalia 16). Clement of Alexandria (c. 155–220) also references women deacons in these communities.
 - **Sabbath Connection:** Some early Christian groups, like the Ebionites, retained Jewish practices such as Sabbath-keeping, though their use of deaconesses is less documented. The broader Eastern Church, which included Sabbath sympathizers, maintained the diaconate for women until at least the 7th century, as noted in the Trullan Council (692), which set an age limit of 40 for deaconess ordination.
 - **Citation:**
 - *Didascalia Apostolorum*, cited in *The Order of Deaconesses in the Early Church*, Sr Vincent Emmanuel Hannon, 1967.
 - Clement of Alexandria, *Stromata*, cited in *Ministry Magazine*, Nancy Vyhmeister, July 2008.
2. **Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century Onward, UK and America)**
- **Description:** The Seventh Day Baptists (SDB) emerged in the UK and America in the early-to-mid-17th century as a Sabbath-keeping denomination. They are one of the earliest explicitly "Seventh-day" Christian groups in the post-Reformation period. Their congregational structure included deacons and deaconesses, elected by church members, to handle practical and ministerial duties.
 - **Evidence of Deaconesses:** The Seventh Day Baptists’ congregational governance model, as described in their modern organizational structure, includes deaconesses who assist with tasks like baptismal preparation, caring for the poor, and church hospitality. While 17th-century records are sparse, their polity suggests continuity with earlier Protestant practices, such as those of the Mennonites, who consecrated deaconesses as early as the 16th century. By the 19th century, deaconesses were explicitly involved in SDB church activities, such as communion and foot-washing ceremonies.
 - **Citation:**
 - *Seventh Day Baptists*, Association of Seventh Day Baptists Australia, www.asdba.org.
 - *The Ministry of the Deaconess Through History, Part 2*, Elder’s Digest, 2017.
3. **Mennonites (16th–19th Centuries, Europe and America)**
- **Description:** The Mennonites, an Anabaptist group with some Sabbath-keeping communities, particularly in the Netherlands and Germany, are noted for their practice of consecrating deaconesses from the 16th century onward. While not all Mennonites were strictly "Seventh-day" in the denominational sense, some adhered to Sabbath practices, especially in early radical Reformation contexts.
 - **Evidence of Deaconesses:** Mennonites had a practice of consecrating deaconesses, as noted in historical records from the 16th century, with roles including caring for the sick and poor and assisting in church services. The *Deaconess* entry in Wikipedia confirms this practice, stating, “Mennonites had a practice of consecrating deaconesses” (). By the 19th century, their deaconess roles were formalized in some communities, aligning with the broader Protestant revival of the diaconate.

- **Sabbath Connection:** Certain Mennonite groups, influenced by Jewish-Christian traditions, observed the Sabbath, particularly in the Netherlands, where Anabaptist communities experimented with Jewish practices.
 - **Citation:**
 - *Deaconess*, Wikipedia, 2024.
 - *The Ministry of the Deaconess Through History, Part 2*, Elder's Digest, 2017.
4. **Moravian Church (18th Century, Europe and America)**
- **Description:** The Moravian Church, under Count Zinzendorf, began consecrating deaconesses in 1745. While not always explicitly Sabbath-keeping, some Moravian communities emphasized Old Testament practices, including occasional Sabbath observance, due to their missionary work and engagement with Jewish traditions.
 - **Evidence of Deaconesses:** The Moravian Church's consecration of deaconesses is well-documented, with roles focused on women's ministry, education, and charity work. The *Deaconess* entry notes, "Count Zinzendorf of the Moravian Church began consecrating deaconesses in 1745" (). These roles were prominent in the 18th and 19th centuries, particularly in mission fields.
 - **Sabbath Connection:** The Moravians' emphasis on biblical practices occasionally included Sabbath-keeping, especially in communities influenced by radical Pietism.
 - **Citation:**
 - *Deaconess*, Wikipedia, 2024.
5. **Seventh-day Adventists (19th Century, United States)**
- **Description:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church, formally organized in 1863, emerged from the Millerite movement and emphasized Sabbath-keeping. Deaconesses have been a part of their structure since the 19th century, with roles rooted in biblical examples like Phoebe and Dorcas.
 - **Evidence of Deaconesses:** The *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual* (18th edition, 2010) outlines the ordination of deaconesses for duties such as assisting with baptisms, communion, foot-washing, and visiting the sick. Ellen G. White, a key figure in Adventism, supported the role of deaconesses, writing in 1902 that women with troubles should consult "the deaconesses of the church" (). By 1856, Adventist leader Frisbie called for women deacons, and White advocated for women to be ordained for specific tasks ().
 - **Citation:**
 - *The Ministry of the Deaconess Through History, Part 2*, Elder's Digest, 2017.
 - *Elder's Digest | The Ministry of Deacons and Deaconesses: Biblical Foundation*, 2020.
 - *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual*, 18th edition, 2010.

Notes

- **Limitations of Evidence:** The term "Seventh-day Christian" is most clearly associated with groups like the Seventh Day Baptists and Seventh-day Adventists, which emerged in the 17th and 19th centuries, respectively. Earlier groups (e.g., Ebionites or other Jewish-Christian sects) may have observed the Sabbath but lack clear records of deaconesses due to sparse documentation. The Eastern Church's deaconess tradition is better documented, but its Sabbath connection is less explicit.
- **Role of Deaconesses:** Across these groups, deaconesses typically assisted with women's ministry, baptismal preparation, care for the sick and poor, and church hospitality, reflecting practical and pastoral needs.
- **Critical Consideration:** The decline of deaconesses in Western Christianity by the Middle Ages, as noted in sources like the *Catholic Encyclopedia* (), suggests that restrictive councils (e.g., Orange, 441; Epaone, 517) limited their roles, which may explain the scarcity of records for Sabbath-keeping groups in the West before the Reformation.

Appendix. Water Baptism by Immersion

Below is an itemized list of Seventh Day Christian groups known to have practiced water baptism by immersion from the 2nd to the 19th centuries, based on available historical evidence. The list focuses on groups explicitly identified as observing the seventh-day Sabbath (Saturday) and practicing believer's baptism by immersion. Due to the scarcity of definitive records for some periods, particularly in the early centuries, the list includes groups with clear documentation, and I've noted where evidence is limited or inferred. Each entry includes bibliographic citations to primary or scholarly sources where possible.

Itemized List of Seventh Day Christian Groups Practicing Water Baptism by Immersion (2nd to 19th Centuries)

1. **Jewish Christians (Ebionites and Nazarenes, 2nd–4th Centuries)**
 - **Description:** Early Jewish-Christian sects, such as the Ebionites and Nazarenes, are noted for adhering to Jewish practices, including Sabbath observance on the seventh day. Some evidence suggests they practiced baptism by immersion, following Jewish ritual purification practices and the model of John the Baptist. The Ebionites, in particular, are described as maintaining Jewish customs while accepting Jesus as the Messiah, and their baptismal practices likely involved full immersion, consistent with early Christian norms.
 - **Evidence for Immersion:** The Didache (c. 60–150 AD) indicates immersion as the preferred method in early Christianity, and Jewish-Christian groups likely followed this practice, given their adherence to Jewish ritual washings (mikveh), which involved full immersion.
 - **Evidence for Seventh Day Sabbath:** These groups retained Jewish Sabbath observance, as noted in early Christian writings, such as those by Epiphanius, who describes the Ebionites' adherence to the Law, including the Sabbath.
 - **Limitations:** Specific references to baptismal practices among these groups are sparse, and their decline by the 4th century limits later evidence.
 - **Bibliographic Citations:**

- The Didache, trans. Michael W. Holmes, *The Apostolic Fathers: Greek Texts and English Translations* (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2007).
- Epiphanius, *Panarion*, Book 30 (Ebionites), trans. Frank Williams (Leiden: Brill, 1994).
- Ferguson, Everett. *Baptism in the Early Church: History, Theology, and Liturgy in the First Five Centuries* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2009).

2. Elkesaites (2nd–4th Centuries)

- **Description:** A Judeo-Christian sect active in the Transjordan region, the Elkesaites combined Jewish practices, including seventh-day Sabbath observance, with Christian elements. They are noted for frequent baptismal rituals, likely by full immersion, as a means of purification.
- **Evidence for Immersion:** Their baptismal practices, described in sources like the *Cologne Mani Codex*, align with Mandaean and Jewish purification rites, which typically involved submersion in running water.
- **Evidence for Seventh Day Sabbath:** The Elkesaites' adherence to Jewish law, including Sabbath observance, is documented by early heresiologists like Hippolytus and Epiphanius.
- **Limitations:** The sect's practices are not extensively detailed, and their influence waned by the 4th century.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Hippolytus, *Refutation of All Heresies*, Book 9, trans. M. David Litwa (Atlanta: SBL Press, 2016).
 - Buckley, Jorunn Jacobsen. *The Mandaeans: Ancient Texts and Modern People* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
 - Ferguson, Everett. *Baptism in the Early Church* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2009).

3. Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century Onward)

- **Description:** Emerging in England during the 17th century, Seventh Day Baptists are a well-documented group that observes the seventh-day Sabbath and practices believer's baptism by immersion. The Mill Yard Church in London, established around 1650, is one of the earliest recorded Seventh Day Baptist congregations.
- **Evidence for Immersion:** Their statement of faith emphasizes baptism by immersion as a symbol of death to sin and new life in Christ, following New Testament examples (Romans 6:3-4). This practice is consistent with general Baptist theology but distinct in its Sabbath observance.
- **Evidence for Seventh Day Sabbath:** Seventh Day Baptists explicitly observe Saturday as the Sabbath, as outlined in their foundational documents and historical records, such as those by Don A. Sanford.
- **Limitations:** This group is primarily relevant from the 17th century onward, with no direct connection to earlier centuries due to the gap in documented Seventh Day Christian groups.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**

- Sanford, Don A. *A Choosing People: The History of Seventh Day Baptists* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1992).
- *The Sabbath Recorder*, published by the Seventh Day Baptist General Conference, 1821–present.
- *Seventh Day Baptists: A Microcosm of Baptist History*, by Don Sanford, Gale Academic OneFile.

4. German Seventh Day Baptists (18th Century Onward)

- **Description:** A subgroup of Seventh Day Baptists, the German Seventh Day Baptists, emerged in the 18th century, notably at the Ephrata Colony in Pennsylvania (c. 1735). They practiced triune forward immersion, a distinctive form of full immersion repeated three times to symbolize the Trinity.
- **Evidence for Immersion:** Their practice of triune immersion is well-documented in historical records of the Ephrata Colony and other German Baptist communities, emphasizing full submersion.
- **Evidence for Seventh Day Sabbath:** The German Seventh Day Baptists, influenced by Johann Conrad Beissel, adhered strictly to Saturday Sabbath observance, as noted in community records.
- **Limitations:** Their practices are specific to the 18th century and later, with limited evidence of continuity with earlier groups.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - Melton's *Encyclopedia of American Religions*, s.v. "Seventh Day Baptists (German)" (Detroit: Gale, 2009).
 - Alderfer, E. Gordon. *The Ephrata Commune: An Early American Counterculture* (Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 1985).
 - Sanford, Don A. *A Choosing People: The History of Seventh Day Baptists* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1992).

5. Seventh-day Adventists (19th Century Onward)

- **Description:** Formed in the 19th century (officially organized in 1863), Seventh-day Adventists emphasize seventh-day Sabbath observance and practice believer's baptism by full immersion. Their theology views baptism as a symbol of dying to self and rising in Christ.
- **Evidence for Immersion:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church explicitly teaches baptism by full immersion, following the example of Jesus' baptism in the Jordan River (Matthew 3:16). This is a core practice outlined in their official publications.
- **Evidence for Seventh Day Sabbath:** Their foundational belief in the seventh-day Sabbath is well-documented in their 28 Fundamental Beliefs and historical writings by Ellen G. White.
- **Limitations:** This group is relevant only from the 19th century, as it emerged from the Millerite movement.
- **Bibliographic Citations:**
 - *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual* (Silver Spring: General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, 2015).
 - White, Ellen G. *The Great Controversy* (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing, 1888).
 - Knight, George R. *A Brief History of Seventh-day Adventists* (Hagerstown: Review and Herald Publishing, 1999).

Notes and Observations

- **Gaps in Historical Record:** From the 5th to the 16th centuries, there is a significant lack of documented Seventh Day Christian groups practicing immersion baptism. This is likely due to the dominance of the Roman Catholic Church, which shifted toward infant baptism and affusion (pouring) by the Middle Ages. Groups like the Waldensians or other dissenting sects occasionally observed the Sabbath but lack clear evidence of consistent immersion baptism practices.
- **Archaeological and Literary Evidence:** Early Christian baptism (1st–4th centuries) was predominantly by immersion, as evidenced by baptismal fonts and texts like the Didache, but specific ties to Sabbath-observing groups are rare outside the Jewish-Christian sects.
- **Terminology Clarification:** The term “immersion” in early sources sometimes refers to partial submersion (standing in water with water poured over the head), but groups like Seventh Day Baptists and Adventists explicitly practice full submersion.
- **Critical Consideration:** The scarcity of evidence for continuous Seventh Day Christian groups between the 4th and 17th centuries suggests that Sabbath observance and immersion baptism were often suppressed or absorbed into mainstream practices. Claims of unbroken succession (e.g., Baptist Successionism) should be approached cautiously, as they may reflect theological agendas rather than historical fact.

Appendix. Laying on of Hands for Healing and Ordination

The practice of laying on of hands for healing and ordination has been a significant ritual in various Christian traditions, including among groups that emphasize Sabbath observance on the seventh day (Saturday). However, identifying specific "Seventh Day" Christian groups from the 2nd to 19th centuries that consistently practiced both laying on of hands for healing and ordination, while strictly adhering to seventh-day Sabbath observance, is challenging due to limited historical records and the evolving nature of Christian denominations. Below, I provide an itemized listing of known or likely groups that align with these criteria, based on historical evidence and the practices associated with Sabbath-keeping traditions. The list is organized chronologically and includes details on their practices where available, followed by a bibliography.

Itemized Listing of Seventh Day Christian Groups (2nd to 19th Century) Observing Laying on of Hands for Healing and Ordination

1. **Ebionites (2nd–4th Century)**
 - **Description:** The Ebionites were an early Jewish-Christian sect that adhered to Jewish law, including observance of the Sabbath on the seventh day. They are often considered a continuation of early Jewish-Christian communities and are noted for their adherence to Mosaic practices alongside Christian beliefs.
 - **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** While direct evidence of healing practices among Ebionites is sparse, their adherence to Jewish traditions, including the laying on of hands (semikhah) for blessing and authority, suggests they may have practiced it for healing, as was common in

early Christian communities (e.g., Mark 16:18, Acts 9:17). The New Testament's association of laying on of hands with healing (e.g., Jesus' practices in Luke 4:40) likely influenced their rituals.

- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** The Ebionites likely followed Jewish traditions of semikhah, as seen in the Old Testament (e.g., Numbers 27:18–23, where Moses ordains Joshua). Early Christian communities, including Jewish-Christian sects, adopted this practice for commissioning leaders (Acts 6:6), and the Ebionites, maintaining Jewish customs, likely continued this for ordaining elders or leaders.
- **Evidence:** Limited primary sources exist, but their practices are inferred from their Jewish-Christian context and early Christian texts like the Pseudo-Clementine writings, which reflect Ebionite theology.

2. Nazarenes (2nd–5th Century)

- **Description:** Another Jewish-Christian sect, the Nazarenes observed the Sabbath and Jewish law while accepting Jesus as the Messiah. They were distinct from the Ebionites in their acceptance of the virgin birth and broader Christian doctrines.
- **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** The Nazarenes, operating within the early Christian milieu, likely adopted practices like those described in the New Testament, where laying on of hands was used for healing (e.g., Acts 28:8, where Paul heals through touch). Their Jewish roots would have reinforced the use of physical touch in blessing and healing rituals.
- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** Similar to the Ebionites, the Nazarenes likely used laying on of hands for ordination, following the apostolic model (e.g., Acts 13:3, where Barnabas and Saul are commissioned). Their adherence to Jewish practices suggests continuity with semikhah traditions.
- **Evidence:** References in patristic writings (e.g., Epiphanius' *Panarion*) describe their Sabbath observance, and their alignment with early Christian practices supports the likelihood of laying on of hands.

3. Sabbatarians in Transylvania (16th–17th Century)

- **Description:** In the 16th century, a group of Unitarian-leaning Christians in Transylvania, influenced by the Reformation, began observing the seventh-day Sabbath. Figures like Andreas Eossi and Simon Pechi led these groups, which emerged from radical Reformation movements.
- **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** Reformation-era Sabbatarians were influenced by Anabaptist and other radical groups, some of which revived apostolic practices like laying on of hands for healing. While specific records are limited, their emphasis on returning to New Testament practices (e.g., Acts 9:17, 19:6) suggests they may have practiced this, particularly in charismatic or revivalist settings.
- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** The Transylvanian Sabbatarians, operating in a Protestant context, likely followed the practice of laying on of hands for ordination, as seen in other Reformation groups (e.g., Acts 6:6). This was a common practice among Anabaptists and other non-conformist groups for commissioning leaders.
- **Evidence:** Historical accounts of Transylvanian Sabbatarians (e.g., Daniel Liechty's works) mention their Sabbath observance, but specific ritual details are less documented. Their alignment with radical Reformation practices supports the inference of laying on of hands.

4. **Seventh Day Baptists (17th–19th Century)**

- **Description:** Emerging in England in the mid-17th century, Seventh Day Baptists were a Protestant group that emphasized seventh-day Sabbath observance. They spread to North America by the late 17th century, with congregations like the Newport, Rhode Island, church (est. 1671).
- **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** Seventh Day Baptists, particularly in their early years, were influenced by Baptist traditions that included laying on of hands for healing, as noted in the 1689 Baptist Confession of Faith (added in 1742). This practice was used in faith healing contexts, often following the model of Acts 28:8 and Mark 16:18. While not universally practiced, some congregations employed it during prayers for the sick.
- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** The Seventh Day Baptists explicitly practiced laying on of hands for ordination, as documented in their church records. This aligned with broader Baptist practices (e.g., Acts 6:6, 1 Timothy 4:14), where ordained clergy laid hands on new ministers or deacons to confer authority.
- **Evidence:** The 1689 Baptist Confession of Faith (amended 1742) explicitly mentions laying on of hands post-baptism and for ordination, and historical records of Seventh Day Baptist churches confirm this practice.

5. **Millerites (19th Century)**

- **Description:** The Millerites, a precursor to the Seventh-day Adventist Church, were a 19th-century American movement led by William Miller, emphasizing the imminent Second Coming of Christ. By the 1840s, some Millerites began adopting seventh-day Sabbath observance, influenced by Rachel Oakes Preston, a Seventh Day Baptist.
- **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** The Millerites were part of the Second Great Awakening, a period of religious revival that often included charismatic practices like healing through laying on of hands. While not a central practice, some Millerite communities, influenced by broader evangelical trends, likely practiced this, as seen in Acts 9:17 and James 5:14–16.
- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** The Millerites, transitioning toward formal organization, likely adopted laying on of hands for ordination, following the Baptist and early Christian models (e.g., Acts 13:3). As they evolved into the Seventh-day Adventist Church, this practice became more standardized.
- **Evidence:** Historical accounts of the Millerite movement (e.g., George Knight's works) note their revivalist context, and their connection to Seventh Day Baptists suggests continuity in ordination practices.

6. **Seventh-day Adventist Church (Formally Established 1863)**

- **Description:** Emerging from the Millerite movement after the Great Disappointment of 1844, the Seventh-day Adventist Church was formally organized in 1863, with a strong emphasis on seventh-day Sabbath observance, health, and eschatology. Co-founder Ellen G. White played a significant role in shaping its theology.
- **Laying on of Hands for Healing:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church has historically practiced laying on of hands for healing, particularly in the context of anointing the sick, as outlined in James 5:14–16. This practice, often accompanied by prayer and anointing with oil, is seen as a means of invoking divine healing and was common in 19th-century Adventist communities.

- **Laying on of Hands for Ordination:** The Seventh-day Adventist Church formally recognizes ordination through the laying on of hands, as described in their *Church Manual*. This practice, based on Acts 6:6 and 1 Timothy 4:14, is used to commission pastors and elders, with hands laid on by ordained ministers or conference leaders.
- **Evidence:** The *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual* and historical accounts (e.g., Ellen G. White's writings) confirm the use of laying on of hands for both healing and ordination. Nancy Vyhmeister's work notes its use in ordination ceremonies.

Notes on Limitations

- **Scarcity of Early Records:** From the 2nd to 16th centuries, explicit references to seventh-day Sabbath-keeping groups are rare, as mainstream Christianity largely adopted Sunday worship. Jewish-Christian sects like the Ebionites and Nazarenes are the primary candidates for early Sabbath-keeping groups, but their practices are inferred from broader Jewish and Christian traditions due to limited primary sources.
- **Reformation-Era Gaps:** The resurgence of seventh-day Sabbath observance in the 16th–17th centuries (e.g., Transylvanian Sabbatarians) is better documented, but specific details on laying on of hands are often inferred from their Protestant context.
- **19th-Century Clarity:** The Seventh Day Baptists and Seventh-day Adventists provide the clearest evidence of both Sabbath observance and laying on of hands, as their practices are well-documented in church records and confessions.

Bibliography

1. Epiphanius of Salamis. *Panarion*. Translated by Frank Williams. Leiden: Brill, 1994.
 - Provides details on early Jewish-Christian sects like the Ebionites and Nazarenes.
2. Liechty, Daniel. *Andreas Fischer and the Sabbatarian Anabaptists*. Scottdale, PA: Herald Press, 1988.
 - Discusses Transylvanian Sabbatarians and their Reformation-era practices.
3. *The 1689 Baptist Confession of Faith*. London, 1742. Available at: baptisthistoryhomepage.com.
 - Outlines Baptist practices, including laying on of hands, relevant to Seventh Day Baptists.
4. Knight, George R. *Millennial Fever and the End of the World: A Study of Millerite Adventism*. Boise, ID: Pacific Press, 1993.
 - Covers the Millerite movement and its transition to Seventh-day Adventism.
5. *Seventh-day Adventist Church Manual*. Silver Spring, MD: General Conference of Seventh-day Adventists, 2015. Available at: www.adventist.org.
 - Details ordination and healing practices in the Seventh-day Adventist Church.
6. Vyhmeister, Nancy. "Ordination in the New Testament?" *Ministry Magazine*, May 2002. Available at: www.ministrymagazine.org.
 - Analyzes ordination practices, including laying on of hands, in early Christianity and Seventh-day Adventism.
7. White, Ellen G. *The Acts of the Apostles*. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press, 1911.
 - Provides Seventh-day Adventist perspectives on apostolic practices, including laying on of hands.
8. *Desiring God*. "The Laying on of Hands." Published February 8, 2018. www.desiringgod.org.
 - Discusses biblical foundations of laying on of hands in Christian practice.

9. *Wikipedia*. "Laying on of Hands." Published August 19, 2003. en.wikipedia.org.
 - Provides an overview of laying on of hands in Jewish and Christian traditions.
10. *Wikipedia*. "Christian Laying on of Hands." Published May 15, 2013. en.m.wikipedia.org.
 - Details Christian practices of laying on of hands across denominations.

Additional Notes

- The search results provided were instrumental in identifying relevant practices, particularly for the Seventh Day Baptists and Seventh-day Adventists. For earlier groups like the Ebionites and Nazarenes, inferences were made based on their Jewish-Christian context and New Testament practices.

Appendix. The New Birth occurring at the Resurrection

The query asks for an itemized list of Seventh-day Christian groups from the 2nd to the 19th century that believed being "born again" occurred at the resurrection, along with a bibliography. The term "Seventh-day Christian groups" refers to Christian communities that observe the Sabbath on the seventh day (Saturday), and the concept of being "born again" in this context is tied to the resurrection of the dead, as opposed to a spiritual transformation during one's lifetime (e.g., through conversion or baptism). The response will focus on identifying such groups within the specified timeframe and their beliefs about being "born again" as occurring at the resurrection, supported by a bibliography of relevant sources.

Historical Context and Challenges

Identifying specific Seventh-day Christian groups from the 2nd to the 19th century that explicitly held the belief that being "born again" occurs at the resurrection presents several challenges:

- **Limited Documentation:** Early Christian history (2nd to 5th centuries) and medieval records often lack detailed accounts of specific sects, especially those considered marginal or heretical, and their precise beliefs about the Sabbath and resurrection.
- **Terminology:** The phrase "born again" (from John 3:3-7) was historically interpreted in various ways, often linked to baptism or spiritual renewal rather than resurrection, until later theological developments.
- **Sabbath Observance:** Seventh-day Sabbath observance was rare in mainstream Christianity after the 4th century, when Sunday became the dominant day of worship, making it difficult to identify groups that both kept the seventh-day Sabbath and held specific eschatological views.
- **Resurrection Belief:** The belief that being "born again" equates to bodily resurrection at Christ's return is not commonly emphasized in early Christian writings, which often focus on spiritual rebirth through baptism or conversion.

Given these challenges, the response will identify groups that are known to have observed the seventh-day Sabbath and, where possible, connect their beliefs to the idea of being "born again" at the resurrection. The focus will primarily be on the 19th century, as this is when Seventh-day groups, particularly

the Seventh-day Adventists, emerged with clearer documentation of such beliefs. Earlier groups (2nd to 18th centuries) are less well-documented, but I will include those with evidence of seventh-day observance and resurrection-focused theology.

Itemized List of Seventh-day Christian Groups (2nd to 19th Century)

Below is an itemized list of Christian groups or movements from the 2nd to the 19th century that observed the seventh-day Sabbath and may have associated being "born again" with the resurrection, based on available historical evidence. Where direct evidence of the "born again" belief is absent, I note groups with related eschatological views.

1. Jewish-Christian Sects (2nd–4th Century, e.g., Ebionites and Nazarenes)

- **Description:** Early Jewish-Christian sects, such as the Ebionites and Nazarenes, maintained Jewish practices, including seventh-day Sabbath observance, during the 2nd to 4th centuries. They emerged from the apostolic Jewish-Christian community in Jerusalem and believed in Jesus as the Messiah while adhering to Jewish law.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: The Ebionites and Nazarenes believed in a bodily resurrection at the end times, consistent with Pharisaic Judaism and early Christian eschatology (e.g., Daniel 12:2, 1 Thessalonians 4:16). The concept of being "born again" as a spiritual rebirth through baptism was present in early Christianity (John 3:3-7), but some scholars suggest these sects may have linked the ultimate transformation to the resurrection, viewing it as the fulfillment of God's kingdom. However, explicit evidence tying "born again" to resurrection is limited, as their surviving texts (e.g., Pseudo-Clementine writings) focus more on law observance than detailed eschatology. Evidence: The Ebionites rejected Pauline theology and emphasized adherence to the Torah, which included Sabbath-keeping. Their eschatology likely aligned with Jewish beliefs in bodily resurrection, as seen in 2 Maccabees and the Pharisees' teachings (Josephus, Antiquities 18.1.3). The Nazarenes, similarly, are described as keeping the Sabbath and expecting a resurrection (Epiphanius, Panarion 29).

Quartodecimans (2nd–4th Century)

Description: The Quartodecimans were early Christians who observed the Passover on the 14th of Nisan (aligned with Jewish practice) and maintained seventh-day Sabbath observance in some regions, particularly in Asia Minor. They were active from the 2nd century but faced opposition from the Roman church, which favored Sunday worship by the 4th century.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: Quartodecimans, following apostolic traditions, emphasized the Passover as a memorial of Christ's death, as taught by Paul (1 Corinthians 5:7). Their eschatology included belief in the resurrection of the dead at Christ's return, as seen in early Christian creeds (e.g., 1 Corinthians 15:3-4). While they used "born again" in the context of baptism (following John 3), their focus on Christ's resurrection as the "firstfruit" (1 Corinthians 15:20) suggests a possible connection to the resurrection as the ultimate transformation, though explicit linkage to "born again" is not well-documented. Evidence: Eusebius records debates between Polycarp (a Quartodeciman) and Anicetus, Bishop of Rome (c. 155–166), over Sabbath and Passover observance (Ecclesiastical History 5.24). Their belief in bodily resurrection is inferred from their adherence to apostolic teachings.

Ethiopian Orthodox Church (Tewahedo, 4th Century Onward)

Description: The Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church, established in the 4th century, has historically observed the seventh-day Sabbath alongside Sunday, a practice rooted in its Jewish-Christian heritage. This dual observance persisted into the modern era.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: The Ethiopian Church's theology emphasizes bodily resurrection at the Second Coming, as articulated in early Christian creeds and scriptures (e.g., 1 Corinthians 15, Revelation 20:4-6). The concept of being "born again" is primarily associated with baptism in their tradition, but their eschatology includes the resurrection as the ultimate transformation into eternal life, aligning with the idea of the "church of the firstborn" (Hebrews 12:22-23). Explicit references to "born again" as resurrection are not prominent, but their resurrection theology supports this interpretation. Evidence: The Ethiopian Church's Kebra Nagast and liturgical texts emphasize Sabbath observance and eschatological resurrection. Their practices reflect a continuity with early Jewish-Christian traditions.

Waldensians (12th–16th Century)

Description: The Waldensians, a proto-Protestant group founded by Peter Waldo in the 12th century, were accused by Catholic authorities of observing the seventh-day Sabbath, though evidence is mixed. They emphasized biblical authority and rejected certain Catholic practices.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: Waldensian theology focused on salvation through faith and adherence to scripture. Their eschatology likely included belief in bodily resurrection at Christ's return, as was standard in medieval Christianity. However, there is no clear evidence that they explicitly equated being "born again" with resurrection, as their writings focus more on moral reform and persecution than detailed eschatology. Their possible Sabbath observance makes them relevant, but the connection to "born again" as resurrection is speculative. Evidence: Catholic records (e.g., Inquisition Documents) accuse Waldensians of Judaizing practices, including Sabbath-keeping, but primary Waldensian texts are scarce. Their belief in resurrection aligns with mainstream Christian eschatology (e.g., Nicene Creed).

Sabbatarian Anabaptists (16th–17th Century)

Description: During the Protestant Reformation, certain Anabaptist groups in Europe, particularly in Moravia and Transylvania, adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance, influenced by a return to biblical practices. These groups, sometimes called Sabbatarians, rejected infant baptism and emphasized adult conversion.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: Anabaptists, including Sabbatarian branches, viewed "born again" primarily as a spiritual transformation through adult baptism, following their rejection of infant baptism. However, some Sabbatarian Anabaptists, influenced by biblical literalism, may have associated the ultimate "new birth" with the resurrection, as they adhered to scriptures like 1 Corinthians 15 and Hebrews 12:22-23, which describe believers as the "church of the firstborn" at the resurrection. Explicit evidence is limited due to persecution and loss of records. Evidence: Anabaptist writings, such as those by Menno Simons, emphasize adult baptism and eschatological hope in resurrection. Sabbatarian Anabaptists in Transylvania (e.g., under Andreas Eossi) are documented as keeping the seventh-day Sabbath (*Historia Ecclesiastica* by Wolfgang Fabricius).

Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century Onward)

Description: The Seventh Day Baptists emerged in England in the 1650s, with congregations like the Mill Yard Church in London (est. 1650) explicitly observing the seventh-day Sabbath. They spread to the American colonies by the late 17th century (e.g., Newport, Rhode Island, 1671).

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: Seventh Day Baptists, as part of the Baptist tradition, typically viewed being "born again" as a spiritual conversion experience tied to adult baptism. However, their eschatology, rooted in Protestant theology, included belief in bodily resurrection at Christ's return (1 Thessalonians 4:16). Some theologians within the movement may have linked the ultimate "new birth" to the resurrection, as suggested by their adherence to scriptures like John 5:25-29 and Revelation 20:4-6, but this was not a central doctrine. Evidence: Seventh Day Baptist confessions of faith (e.g., The Standard Confession of 1660) emphasize Sabbath observance and standard Protestant eschatology, including resurrection. Their focus on biblical literalism supports a possible resurrection-based interpretation of "born again."

"Millerite Adventists and Early Seventh-day Adventists (19th Century)

Description: The Millerite movement, led by William Miller, emerged in the 1830s in the United States, emphasizing the imminent Second Coming of Christ. After the Great Disappointment of 1844, a subgroup of Sabbatarian Adventists, led by figures like Ellen G. White and James White, adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance and formally organized as the Seventh-day Adventist Church in 1863.

Belief in "Born Again" and Resurrection: The Seventh-day Adventists explicitly teach that being "born again" occurs at the resurrection of the righteous at Christ's Second Coming. They interpret John 3:3-7 as referring to the transformation into a spirit being at the resurrection, not a spiritual rebirth during life. This is articulated in their doctrine of the "first resurrection" (Revelation 20:4-6), where believers become the "church of the firstborn" (Hebrews 12:22-23). This belief distinguishes them from evangelical interpretations of "born again" as a conversion experience. Evidence: Early Adventist writings, such as Ellen G. White's *The Great Controversy* (1858), emphasize the resurrection as the moment of ultimate transformation. The Seventh-day Adventist Church's fundamental beliefs, formalized in 1863, include the doctrine that the righteous are resurrected to eternal life at Christ's return.

Analysis and Notes

2nd–18th Centuries: Evidence for Seventh-day Christian groups is sparse before the 17th century. Jewish-Christian sects (Ebionites, Nazarenes) and Quartodecimans maintained Sabbath observance and believed in bodily resurrection, but their linkage of "born again" to resurrection is inferred rather than explicit due to limited surviving texts. The Ethiopian Orthodox Church provides a rare example of continuous Sabbath observance, with resurrection theology that aligns with the query. Waldensians and Sabbatarian Anabaptists are less definitive due to incomplete records and their focus on other theological issues. 19th Century: The Seventh-day Adventist Church is the most prominent and well-documented group that explicitly ties being "born again" to the resurrection, rooted in their interpretation of biblical texts like John 3 and Hebrews 12. Their emergence in the 19th century reflects a restorationist impulse to return to apostolic practices, including Sabbath-keeping and a literal resurrection. Gaps in Evidence: The scarcity of explicit references to "born again" as resurrection before the 19th century reflects the dominance of baptismal interpretations of the term in early and medieval Christianity. Persecution of Sabbath-keeping groups (e.g., by the Roman church) also reduced surviving documentation.

Bibliography

Below is a bibliography of sources used to compile this list, including those from the provided web results and additional references for historical context. All sources are cited in accordance with the provided guidelines.

Epiphanius of Salamis. Panarion. Translated by Frank Williams. Leiden: Brill, 1994. [For Ebionites and Nazarenes] Eusebius. Ecclesiastical History. Translated by Kirsopp Lake. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1926. [For Quartodecimans and early Christian practices] Hislop, Alexander. The Two Babylons. London: S.W. Partridge & Co., 1853. [For pagan influences on "born again" concepts]

Josephus, Flavius. Antiquities of the Jews. Translated by William Whiston. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 1987. [For Jewish beliefs on resurrection]

White, Ellen G. The Great Controversy. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1858. [For Seventh-day Adventist theology]

Wright, N.T. "Jesus' Resurrection and Christian Origins." *Gregorianum* 83, no. 4 (2002): 615–635. Seventh-day Adventist Church emerged from religious fervor of 19th Century. Adventist News Network, 2013. Seventh-day Adventist theology. Wikipedia, 2006. History of early Christianity. Britannica, 2025. Resurrection of Jesus. Wikipedia, 2025. Christianity in the 1st century. Wikipedia, 2024. Born Again Christians?. CRI/Voice, 2018. Chapter One - Overview of "Born Again". Christian Biblical Church of God, 2015. Databases - History of Christianity Guide. Yale University Library Research Guides, 2025.

Conclusion

The Seventh-day Adventist Church (19th century) is the primary group that explicitly links being "born again" to the resurrection at Christ's Second Coming, supported by clear doctrinal statements. Earlier groups, such as Jewish-Christian sects, Quartodecimans, the Ethiopian Orthodox Church, Waldensians, Sabbatarian Anabaptists, and Seventh Day Baptists, observed the seventh-day Sabbath and held resurrection beliefs, but evidence directly tying "born again" to resurrection is limited or inferred. The bibliography provides sources for further exploration of these groups and their theology.

Appendix. The Importance of Israel

The belief that Israel remains significant in God's plan, often tied to eschatological or restorationist views, was not a dominant perspective among Christian groups from the 2nd to 19th centuries, as mainstream Christianity largely adopted supersessionism (the idea that the Church replaced Israel as God's chosen people). However, certain Christian groups, particularly those emphasizing biblical prophecy and the Jewish roots of Christianity, held views that maintained Israel's theological importance. Below is a list of notable Christian groups or movements from the 2nd to 19th centuries that, to varying degrees, recognized the significance of Israel (the Jewish people or the land) in God's plan, followed by a bibliography of relevant sources. Since Seventh-day Adventists, a prominent Sabbath-keeping group, emerged in the 19th century and have specific eschatological views, I will include them and clarify their stance, alongside earlier groups where applicable.

List of Seventh-Day Christian Groups and Others Emphasizing Israel's Importance (2nd to 19th Century)

1. Early Jewish-Christian Sects (2nd–4th Century)

- **Description:** Early Jewish-Christian groups, such as the Ebionites and Nazarenes, maintained Jewish practices, including Sabbath observance, and likely viewed the Jewish people and the land of Israel as central to God’s covenant. These groups believed in Jesus as the Messiah but adhered to Torah observance, suggesting a continued role for Israel in salvation history. Their views were marginalized as Christianity became predominantly Gentile and adopted supersessionist theology under Roman influence.
 - **Evidence of Israel’s Importance:** These groups emphasized the Jewish roots of Christianity, including the importance of Jerusalem and the Jewish people in God’s plan, though specific texts on eschatology are sparse due to their suppression by the early Church.
 - **Sabbath Observance:** Observed the seventh-day Sabbath, aligning with Jewish tradition.
 - **Limitations:** Exact beliefs about Israel’s eschatological role are unclear due to limited surviving texts, but their adherence to Jewish law implies a theological connection to Israel.
2. **Sabbath-Keeping Christian Communities in the Byzantine and Medieval Periods (4th–15th Century)**
- **Description:** Small, often marginalized groups in the Byzantine Empire and beyond, such as certain monastic communities or sects labeled as “Judaizing” Christians, observed the Sabbath and maintained an interest in Jewish practices. These groups, sometimes associated with the Quartodecimans (who followed Jewish timing for Passover), may have held views sympathetic to Israel’s enduring role, though explicit documentation is scarce.
 - **Evidence of Israel’s Importance:** Their adherence to Jewish practices suggests a belief in the enduring significance of Jewish traditions, potentially including the land of Israel as a holy site. The construction of churches like the Church of the Holy Sepulchre by Constantine’s mother, Helena, in the 4th century reflects a broader Christian interest in the land of Israel, though not necessarily its eschatological role.
 - **Sabbath Observance:** Some groups observed the seventh-day Sabbath, resisting the shift to Sunday worship enforced by the Council of Laodicea (circa 364 CE).
 - **Limitations:** These groups were often persecuted, and their beliefs about Israel’s role were not well-documented, making it difficult to confirm eschatological views.
3. **Waldensians (12th–16th Century)**
- **Description:** The Waldensians, a proto-Protestant group founded by Peter Waldo in the 12th century, emphasized biblical authority and simple living. While not explicitly focused on Israel, their rejection of Catholic orthodoxy and interest in biblical prophecy occasionally aligned with views that saw the Jewish people or the land of Israel as significant in God’s plan, especially in later interpretations by Protestant reformers influenced by Waldensian ideas.
 - **Evidence of Israel’s Importance:** Their emphasis on Scripture over Church tradition may have led some Waldensians to consider Old Testament promises to Israel as still relevant, though this was not a central doctrine.
 - **Sabbath Observance:** Some Waldensian communities reportedly observed the seventh-day Sabbath, influenced by their rejection of Catholic practices, though this was not universal.
 - **Limitations:** Their primary focus was on moral reform, not eschatology, so views on Israel were secondary and not systematically developed.

4. Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century)

- **Description:** Emerging in England in the early 17th century, Seventh Day Baptists were a Protestant group that observed the seventh-day Sabbath, influenced by a return to biblical practices during the Reformation. They believed the Sabbath was a perpetual commandment and saw continuity between Old Testament Israel and the Church, though not necessarily in a dispensationalist sense.
- **Evidence of Israel's Importance:** Their emphasis on the Old Testament and Sabbath observance suggests a theological affinity for Israel's covenantal role. Some leaders, influenced by Puritan restorationist ideas, may have seen the Jewish people or the land as significant in prophecy, particularly in the context of millenarian expectations.
- **Sabbath Observance:** Central to their identity, they observed Saturday as the Sabbath, aligning with Jewish practice.
- **Key Influence:** Rachel Oakes Preston, a Seventh Day Baptist, introduced Sabbath observance to the Millerite Adventists, influencing the formation of Seventh-day Adventists.

Limitations: Their focus was primarily on Sabbath theology, not a developed eschatology about Israel's role.

Puritan Restorationists (16th–17th Century)

Description: English Puritans, particularly in the 17th century, developed restorationist ideas that emphasized the return of Jews to the land of Israel as a precursor to Christ's return. Figures like Thomas Brightman and John Owen advocated for a Jewish return to Palestine, seeing it as part of God's prophetic plan. These ideas influenced later Christian Zionism. Evidence of Israel's Importance: Puritans believed in a literal fulfillment of Old Testament prophecies, including the restoration of Israel, which they saw as a sign of the end times. This was rooted in premillennial eschatology, which anticipated Christ's return before a thousand-year reign.

Sabbath Observance: While most Puritans observed Sunday, some, influenced by biblical literalism, explored seventh-day Sabbath observance, though this was not widespread. Limitations: Not all Puritans were Sabbath-keepers, and their focus on Israel was more prophetic than practical until the 19th century.

Millerite Movement (19th Century)

Description: The Millerites, led by William Miller in the 1830s–1840s in the United States, were a premillennialist group expecting Christ's imminent return (circa 1844). Their focus on biblical prophecy included an interest in the Jewish people and the land of Israel as part of end-time events, though this was secondary to their apocalyptic focus. Evidence of Israel's Importance: The Millerites' historicist interpretation of prophecy (e.g., Daniel and Revelation) often included references to Israel's role in eschatology, though they saw the Church as the primary heir of God's promises. Some Millerites, influenced by Puritan restorationism, anticipated a Jewish return to Palestine. Sabbath Observance: Initially Sunday-keepers, some Millerites adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance through the influence of Seventh Day Baptists (e.g., Rachel Oakes Preston), leading to the formation of the Seventh-day Adventist Church. Limitations: Their eschatology was not dispensationalist, and their views on Israel were less developed than those of later groups like dispensationalists.

Seventh-day Adventist Church (19th Century)

Description: Formally established in 1863, the Seventh-day Adventist Church grew out of the Millerite movement during the Second Great Awakening. The denomination emphasizes the seventh-day Sabbath, the imminent Second Coming of Christ, and a historicist interpretation of biblical prophecy. Unlike dispensationalists, Adventists do not see the modern state of Israel (established in 1948) as a direct fulfillment of prophecy but view the Church as the spiritual heir of Old Testament Israel. However, some Adventist teachings acknowledge the Jewish people's historical and theological significance.

Evidence of Israel's Importance: Adventists believe Old Testament prophecies about Israel are fulfilled spiritually in the Christian Church, centered around Jesus. They reject dispensationalism, which assigns a distinct eschatological role to national Israel (e.g., a restored Jewish kingdom). However, their focus on the Sabbath and biblical prophecy reflects an appreciation for Israel's covenantal history, and some early Adventists speculated about the Jewish people's role in end-time events, though not as prominently as dispensationalists. The establishment of an Adventist presence in Palestine (pre-1948) and modern Israel (e.g., the "Life and Peace" publishing house in Jerusalem) indicates a practical interest in the region. Sabbath Observance: A core doctrine, Adventists observe Saturday as the Sabbath, aligning with Jewish tradition and emphasizing continuity with biblical Israel. Key Figures: Ellen G. White, a co-founder, shaped Adventist eschatology through works like *The Great Controversy*, which interprets prophecies but does not emphasize a restored national Israel. Uriah Smith's *Daniel and the Revelation* further outlines Adventist views on prophecy, focusing on spiritual Israel. Limitations: Adventists explicitly reject the dispensationalist view that the modern state of Israel fulfills prophecy, seeing 1948 as a political rather than prophetic event. Their focus is on spiritual Israel (the Church), which limits their emphasis on the land or Jewish people in eschatology.

Dispensationalists (19th Century)

Description: Emerging in the 19th century through John Nelson Darby and the Plymouth Brethren, dispensationalism is a theological framework that emphasizes distinct divine plans for Israel and the Church. Dispensationalists believe Old Testament prophecies about Israel will be literally fulfilled, including a Jewish return to the land and a restored kingdom during the millennium. While not inherently Sabbath-observing, some dispensationalist groups were influenced by Sabbath-keeping movements.

Evidence of Israel's Importance: Dispensationalists see the Jewish people and the land of Israel as central to God's end-time plan. They interpret events like the 1948 establishment of Israel as prophetic fulfillment, though this postdates the 19th century. Their theology, developed in the 19th century, anticipated a Jewish return to Palestine and a rebuilt temple.

Sabbath Observance: Most dispensationalists observed Sunday, but their emphasis on biblical literalism occasionally led to interactions with Sabbath-keeping groups, such as Seventh Day Baptists or early Adventists. Limitations: Dispensationalism is a broader evangelical movement, not a specific seventh-day group, but its influence on later Sabbath-keeping groups (e.g., Adventists) is notable in eschatological discussions.

Notes on the Scope

Seventh-Day Focus: The query specifically asks for "seventh day Christian groups," but from the 2nd to 19th centuries, explicit seventh-day Sabbath-keeping groups were rare until the 17th century (e.g., Seventh Day Baptists) and became prominent with the Seventh-day Adventists in the 19th century. Earlier groups like the Ebionites or Byzantine Sabbath-keepers are included due to their Sabbath observance, though their views on Israel are less documented.

Israel's Importance: The concept of Israel's importance varied. Early Jewish-Christians saw Israel as central to God's covenant, while later groups like Puritans and dispensationalists emphasized eschatological restoration. Seventh-day Adventists, however, spiritualize Israel's role, focusing on the Church. Historical Context: The Crusades (12th–13th centuries) and Christian pilgrimages to Jerusalem (e.g., by Helena in the 4th century) reflect a general Christian interest in the land of Israel, but these were not tied to seventh-day observance or eschatological views of Israel's restoration until the Reformation and later.

Bibliography

Primary Sources and Historical Texts

White, Ellen G. *The Great Controversy*. Pacific Press, 1888. (Influential in Seventh-day Adventist eschatology, outlining a spiritual view of Israel.) Smith, Uriah. *Daniel and the Revelation*. Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1897. (Classic Adventist commentary on prophecy, emphasizing spiritual Israel.) Eusebius. *Ecclesiastical History*. Translated by C.F. Cruse, Hendrickson Publishers, 1998. (Details early Jewish-Christian groups like the Ebionites and Nazarenes.) Secondary Sources Shapira, Anita. *Israel: A History*. Brandeis University Press, 2012. (Discusses Christian Zionism and its roots in Puritan thought.) Knight, George R. *A Brief History of Seventh-day Adventists*. Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1999. (Covers the origins and theology of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, including its rejection of dispensationalism.) Ariel, Yaakov. *On Behalf of Israel: American Fundamentalist Attitudes toward Jews, Judaism, and Zionism, 1865–1945*. Carlson Publishing, 1991. (Explores dispensationalist views on Israel's prophetic role.) Tuchman, Barbara W. *Bible and Sword: England and Palestine from the Bronze Age to Balfour*. New York University Press, 1956. (Traces Puritan and Restorationist views on Israel.) Neusner, Jacob. *Judaism and Christianity in the Age of Constantine*. University of Chicago Press, 1987. (Examines early Jewish-Christian relations and views on Israel.)

Web References

"Seventh-day Adventist Church." Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church. Accessed May 22, 2025.
"History of Israel." Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_Israel. Accessed May 22, 2025. "Christian Zionism." Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_Zionism. Accessed May 22, 2025. "Seventh-day Adventists fit into the rhythms — and faiths — of Israeli life." Religion News Service. <https://religionnews.com/2019/05/04/seventh-day-adventists-fit-into-the-rhythms-and-faiths-of-israeli-life/>. Accessed May 22, 2025. "How Should Christians View Israel?" Adventist Review. <https://www.adventistreview.org/2007-11-06/how-should-christians-view-israel>. Accessed May 22, 2025.

Additional Notes

Lack of Explicit Seventh-Day Groups:

Before the 17th century, seventh-day Sabbath observance was rare among Christians due to the dominance of Sunday worship enforced by the Catholic and Byzantine churches. Groups like the Ebionites and Waldensians are included as potential Sabbath-keepers, but evidence is limited. Critical Perspective: The

sources provided (e.g., Wikipedia, Adventist Review) are useful but reflect establishment narratives. I've critically examined them to avoid overstatement, particularly regarding Adventist views, which explicitly reject dispensationalist interpretations of Israel's role.

Further Research:

For deeper insights, primary texts like Ellen G. White's writings or Puritan sermons (e.g., by Thomas Brightman) are recommended, as secondary sources may oversimplify complex theological positions.

Appendix. Non-Trinitarian Beliefs

Identifying specific Seventh-day Christian groups that were explicitly non-Trinitarian from the 2nd to the 19th centuries is challenging due to limited historical records explicitly tying non-Trinitarianism to groups with a distinct seventh-day Sabbath observance during this period. The seventh-day Sabbath was not a widespread practice among Christian groups until the 19th century, and non-Trinitarianism often appeared in broader theological movements rather than strictly Sabbath-keeping groups. Below, I provide a list of groups or movements that either emphasized seventh-day Sabbath observance or were non-Trinitarian, with some overlap, based on available historical data. I've included a bibliography for further reference.

List of Relevant Groups and Movements

1. Ebionites (2nd–4th Centuries)

- **Description:** Early Jewish-Christian sect that adhered to Jewish law, including Sabbath observance. They rejected the divinity of Jesus, viewing Him as a human prophet or Messiah, not part of a divine Trinity. Their non-Trinitarianism aligned with adoptionist views, where Jesus became divine at His baptism or resurrection.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Likely observed the seventh-day Sabbath due to their adherence to Jewish law, though primary sources are scarce.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Rejected the full divinity of Jesus, denying the Trinitarian framework established later at Nicaea (325 AD).
- **Note:** Extinct by the 5th century, with limited surviving documentation.

2. Arians (4th Century)

- **Description:** Followers of Arius, who taught that Jesus, the Son, was subordinate to God the Father and not co-eternal or co-equal, rejecting the Trinitarian doctrine formalized at Nicaea.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** No definitive evidence ties Arians specifically to seventh-day Sabbath observance, but some fringe Christian groups influenced by Arianism may have retained Jewish practices, including Sabbath-keeping, in certain regions.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Arianism explicitly denied the co-equality of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, viewing Jesus as a created being.
- **Note:** Arianism was widespread but suppressed after the Council of Constantinople (381 AD).

3. Cathars (11th–13th Centuries)

- **Description:** A dualist Christian sect in southern France and parts of Italy, known for rejecting many Catholic doctrines, including the Trinity. They viewed the material world as evil and held a docetic view of Jesus, denying His full divinity.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** No direct evidence confirms consistent seventh-day Sabbath observance, but some Cathar communities may have adopted Jewish-influenced practices, including Sabbath-keeping, as part of their rejection of Catholic traditions.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Their dualist theology was incompatible with Trinitarianism, as they rejected the orthodox view of God’s nature.
- **Note:** Persecuted and eradicated by the Catholic Church during the Albigensian Crusade (13th century).

4. Socinians (16th–17th Centuries)

- **Description:** Emerging from the Radical Reformation, the Socinians (named after Faustus Socinus) were a Unitarian group in Poland and Transylvania who rejected the Trinity, viewing Jesus as a human endowed with divine authority but not God.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Some Socinian-influenced groups, particularly in Transylvania, were linked to Sabbatarian movements (e.g., Transylvanian Sabbatarians), who adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance alongside non-Trinitarian views.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Explicitly Unitarian, they considered the Holy Spirit an aspect of God’s power, not a distinct person.
- **Note:** Suppressed in Poland by the 17th century but influenced later Unitarian movements.

5. Transylvanian Sabbatarians (16th–17th Centuries)

- **Description:** A group in Transylvania, initially influenced by Socinianism, that adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance and rejected Trinitarianism. They leaned toward Judaizing practices, emphasizing Old Testament laws.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Explicitly practiced seventh-day Sabbath worship, as documented in historical records of their communities.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Rejected the Trinity, aligning with Unitarian theology, viewing Jesus as a human Messiah.
- **Note:** Persecuted and largely absorbed into other Unitarian or Jewish communities by the 17th century.

6. Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century)

- **Description:** Emerging in England in the mid-17th century, Seventh Day Baptists emphasized seventh-day Sabbath observance. While many were Trinitarian, some early congregations, particularly those influenced by Radical Reformation ideas, held non-Trinitarian views.
- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Explicitly observed the seventh-day Sabbath, distinguishing them from other Baptists.
- **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Limited evidence suggests that some early Seventh Day Baptist congregations, especially those influenced by Unitarian or Socinian ideas, rejected the Trinity, though this was not universal.
- **Note:** By the 18th century, most Seventh Day Baptists aligned with Trinitarian orthodoxy.

7. Millerite Adventists (19th Century)

- **Description:** The Millerite movement, led by William Miller, anticipated Christ’s return in 1844. While not all Millerites were non-Trinitarian, many early leaders held non-Trinitarian views, influenced by Restorationist theology.

- **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Some Millerite offshoots, particularly those who became Seventh-day Adventists, adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance post-1844.
 - **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Early leaders like James White and Joseph Bates rejected the Trinity, viewing Jesus as the begotten Son and the Holy Spirit as God's power, not a person.
 - **Note:** The Millerite movement evolved into the Seventh-day Adventist Church, which remained non-Trinitarian until the mid-20th century.
8. **Early Seventh-day Adventists (19th Century)**
- **Description:** Formed in 1863, the Seventh-day Adventist Church was explicitly non-Trinitarian in its early decades, influenced by leaders like Ellen White, James White, and Uriah Smith. They emphasized seventh-day Sabbath observance and a non-Trinitarian theology.
 - **Evidence of Seventh-day Practice:** Central to their identity, as reflected in their name and fundamental beliefs.
 - **Non-Trinitarian Aspect:** Rejected the Trinity, teaching that Jesus was the begotten Son of God and the Holy Spirit was God's power, not a distinct person. This stance persisted until the 1930s–1950s, with official Trinitarian adoption in 1980.
 - **Note:** Some non-Trinitarian Adventist offshoots, like the Creation Seventh Day Adventist Church, continue to exist.

Notes on Methodology

- **Challenges in Identification:** Few Christian groups before the 19th century explicitly combined seventh-day Sabbath observance with non-Trinitarianism. Sabbath-keeping was rare among Christians after the 4th century, and non-Trinitarianism often appeared in broader theological movements (e.g., Arianism, Socinianism) without clear Sabbath emphasis.
- **Geographical and Temporal Scope:** The groups listed span Europe, the Middle East, and North America, reflecting the spread of non-Trinitarian and Sabbath-keeping ideas. The 19th century saw a resurgence of both due to the Restorationist movement and the Second Great Awakening.
- **Source Limitations:** Primary sources for early groups like the Ebionites are limited, often relying on patristic writings or later reconstructions. For later groups like the Socinians and Seventh-day Adventists, more detailed records exist.

Bibliography

1. **Cross, F. L., & Livingstone, E. A. (Eds.).** (2005). *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (3rd ed.). Oxford University Press.
 - Provides detailed entries on non-Trinitarian groups like the Ebionites, Arians, and Socinians, with historical context.
2. **Frend, W. H. C.** (1996). *The Archaeology of Early Christianity: A History*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press.
 - Discusses early Christian sects, including potential Sabbath-keeping practices among Jewish-Christian groups.
3. **Burt, Merlin.** (1998). *Demise of Semi-Arianism and Anti-Trinitarianism in Adventist Theology, 1888–1957*. Andrews University, Center for Adventist Research.
 - Details the non-Trinitarian origins of the Seventh-day Adventist Church and its theological evolution.
4. **Tabbernee, William (Ed.).** (2014). *Early Christianity in Contexts: An Exploration across Cultures and Continents*. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic.
 - Explores the diversity of early Christian practices, including Jewish-Christian groups with possible Sabbath observance.

5. **Tuggy, Dale (Ed.).** (2021). *Trinity*. In *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*.
 - Provides a philosophical and historical overview of Trinitarian debates, including non-Trinitarian movements like Socinianism.
6. **Fairchild, Mary.** (2021). *9 Faith Groups That Reject the Trinity*. Learn Religions.
 - Lists non-Trinitarian groups, including some with historical Sabbath-keeping connections.
7. **Knight, George R.** (2000). *A Search for Identity: The Development of Seventh-day Adventist Beliefs*. Review and Herald Publishing Association.
 - Chronicles the non-Trinitarian roots of the Seventh-day Adventist Church and its shift toward Trinitarianism.
8. **Wilbur, Earl M.** (1977). *A History of Socinianism in Poland and Transylvania*. Beacon Press.
 - Discusses Socinian theology and its influence on Sabbatarian groups in Transylvania.
9. **Bacchus, Francis Joseph.** (1913). *The Catholic Encyclopedia: Cathars*. Robert Appleton Company.
 - Details the Cathars' rejection of Trinitarianism and possible Jewish-influenced practices.
10. **White, Ellen G.** (1906). *Selected Messages, Book 1*. Review and Herald Publishing Association.
 - Includes statements affirming Ellen White's non-Trinitarian stance, relevant to early Seventh-day Adventist theology.

Additional Notes

- **Primary Sources:** For early groups like the Ebionites and Arians, primary sources are limited to patristic writings (e.g., Irenaeus, Eusebius) or archaeological evidence (e.g., catacomb inscriptions). For 19th-century groups like the Seventh-day Adventists, primary sources include church publications like *Review and Herald*.
- **Further Research:** For deeper study, explore the *Ante-Nicene Fathers* series for early Christian writings and the *Adventist Review* archives for 19th-century Adventist theology.
- **Modern Non-Trinitarian Seventh-day Groups:** Some offshoots of the Seventh-day Adventist Church, like the Creation Seventh Day Adventist Church, continue non-Trinitarian beliefs and Sabbath observance, but these are post-19th century.

Appendix. Wednesday Crucifixion

There is limited historical evidence of seventh-day observing churches (those keeping the Sabbath on Saturday) between the 2nd and 19th centuries that explicitly believed in a Wednesday crucifixion. The Wednesday crucifixion view is a minority position in Christian history, often tied to specific interpretations of biblical chronology, and explicit documentation connecting it to seventh-day observing groups is sparse. Below is an analysis based on available historical data, including the provided search results, addressing groups that may align with both criteria (seventh-day observance and Wednesday crucifixion belief) and a bibliography of relevant sources.

- **Challenges in Identifying Such Churches**

- **Limited Documentation**: Early Christian records often focus on dominant theological positions, and minority views like a Wednesday crucifixion were rarely preserved in detail, especially among Sabbath-keeping groups.
- **Suppression of Non-Orthodox Views**: By the 4th century, the Roman Church's adoption of Sunday worship and a Friday crucifixion narrative marginalized Sabbath-keeping groups, many of whom were labeled as heretical (e.g., Ebionites, Nazarenes).
- **Wednesday Crucifixion Evidence**: The Wednesday crucifixion theory often relies on interpreting Matthew 12:40 ("three days and three nights") literally, which was not a mainstream view. Groups holding this belief were often small and their records fragmented.
- **Sabbath Observance**: Seventh-day Sabbath observance persisted in pockets (e.g., among Jewish Christians, Ethiopian churches, and later groups like the Waldensians or Seventh Day Baptists), but their crucifixion day beliefs are not always explicitly documented.

- **Potential Groups and Evidence**

Below is a list of groups or movements that may have observed the seventh-day Sabbath and could have held a Wednesday crucifixion view, based on historical proximity to Jewish practices or minority crucifixion chronologies. Due to the lack of definitive evidence for many groups explicitly endorsing a Wednesday crucifixion, some entries are speculative but grounded in historical context.

1. **Ebionites (2nd–4th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: The Ebionites, a Jewish-Christian sect, adhered to Jewish practices, including seventh-day Sabbath observance, as noted by early church fathers like Epiphanius (Panarion, c. 375 CE). They maintained Mosaic Law alongside Christian beliefs.
- **Crucifixion View**: No direct evidence confirms a Wednesday crucifixion belief, but their adherence to Jewish calendrical practices (e.g., Passover timing) suggests they might have favored a chronology aligning with a literal "three days and three nights" (Matthew 12:40), potentially supporting a Wednesday crucifixion. The Didascalia Apostolorum (c. 200 CE) mentions a Tuesday night Passover and Wednesday crucifixion, which could align with Jewish-Christian groups like the Ebionites who followed similar calendars. [(<https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday>)]
- **Evidence Limitation**: The Ebionites' texts are lost, and most information comes from hostile sources (e.g., Irenaeus, Eusebius), making it unclear if they explicitly held a Wednesday view.

2. **Nazarenes (2nd–5th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: The Nazarenes, another Jewish-Christian group, observed the Sabbath and Jewish feasts, as described by Epiphanius and Jerome. They were distinguished from Ebionites by their acceptance of Jesus' divinity but retained Jewish practices.
- **Crucifixion View**: Like the Ebionites, their strict adherence to Jewish calendrical traditions could imply a non-Friday crucifixion date, possibly Wednesday, especially if they interpreted Passover timing differently from the emerging Roman Church. The Didascalia Apostolorum's reference to a

Tuesday night Passover and Wednesday crucifixion might reflect beliefs held by such groups. [(https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday)]

- **Evidence Limitation**: No surviving Nazarene texts explicitly confirm a Wednesday crucifixion, and their beliefs were overshadowed by orthodox standardization.

3. **Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church (4th–19th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: The Ethiopian Church has historically observed both Saturday (Sabbath) and Sunday, a practice rooted in its Jewish-Christian origins and retention of Jewish practices like circumcision and dietary laws. This dual observance is noted in medieval Ethiopian texts like the Kebra Nagast.

- **Crucifixion View**: No explicit record confirms a Wednesday crucifixion belief, but the Ethiopian Church's use of a distinct calendar (closer to Jewish lunar calculations) and their independence from Roman liturgical norms could suggest openness to alternative chronologies. Their isolation preserved unique traditions, but specific crucifixion day beliefs are undocumented.

- **Evidence Limitation**: Ethiopian sources focus more on liturgical practices than crucifixion chronology, leaving this connection speculative.

4. **Waldensians (12th–19th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: Some Waldensian communities, particularly in their early years (12th–13th centuries), were accused of observing the Sabbath, though evidence is mixed. Later Waldensians aligned with Protestantism and likely adopted Sunday worship.

- **Crucifixion View**: There is no direct evidence that Waldensians held a Wednesday crucifixion view. Their emphasis on scripture over tradition might have led some subgroups to question the Friday crucifixion narrative, but this is speculative.

- **Evidence Limitation**: Waldensian records were heavily suppressed, and surviving documents do not address crucifixion chronology.

5. **Seventh Day Baptists (17th–19th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: Emerging in England in the 17th century, Seventh Day Baptists explicitly observed the seventh-day Sabbath, as documented in their confessions of faith (e.g., John Traske's writings, c. 1618).

- **Crucifixion View**: No clear evidence suggests they held a Wednesday crucifixion belief. Their focus was on Sabbath theology rather than crucifixion chronology. However, their emphasis on biblical literalism could have led some to explore a Wednesday view, especially given debates about "three days and three nights."

- **Evidence Limitation**: Seventh Day Baptist records do not emphasize crucifixion debates, focusing instead on Sabbath justification.

6. **Early Adventist Groups (19th Century)**

- **Sabbath Observance**: The Millerite movement and early Seventh-day Adventists (post-1844) adopted seventh-day Sabbath observance, influenced by figures like Rachel Oakes Preston. This is well-documented in Adventist histories, such as Ellen G. White's writings.

- **Crucifixion View**: Some early Adventists debated a Wednesday crucifixion due to their focus on biblical chronology and the Jewish calendar. Grace E. Amadon's research (1940s, but reflecting earlier Adventist debates) critiques Wednesday crucifixion arguments, indicating that such views existed among Adventists but were not mainstream. [(<https://www.ministrymagazine.org/archive/1942/05/the-wednesday-crucifixion-argument>)]

- **Evidence Limitation**: The Wednesday crucifixion view was a minority position even among Adventists, and most settled on a Friday crucifixion based on traditional interpretations.

- **Other Historical Notes**

- **Didascalia Apostolorum (c. 200 CE)**: This early Christian document, purporting apostolic authority, describes a Tuesday night Passover and Wednesday crucifixion, aligning with a minority view that could have been held by Jewish-Christian or Sabbath-observing groups. It explicitly mentions the week starting with Sunday as the first day, with Wednesday as the fourth day beginning at sunset Tuesday. [(<https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday>)]

- **Socrates and Gregory of Tours (5th–6th Century)**: Church historian Socrates notes some Eastern Christians celebrated the resurrection on the Sabbath (Saturday), not Sunday, suggesting Sabbath observance persisted. Gregory of Tours mentions a belief in a seventh-day resurrection, which could imply a Wednesday crucifixion to fit “three days and three nights.” These references suggest minority groups with alternative chronologies, but they do not explicitly name seventh-day observing churches with a Wednesday crucifixion view. [(<https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday>)]

- **Jewish Calendar Influence**: Groups retaining Jewish calendrical practices (e.g., Ebionites, Nazarenes, or Ethiopian Christians) might have favored a Wednesday crucifixion due to differing Passover calculations, as modern Jewish calendars (post-4th century) shifted feast dates, complicating alignment with a Friday crucifixion. [(<https://www.ministrymagazine.org/archive/1942/05/the-wednesday-crucifixion-argument>)]

- **Summary**

No definitive list of seventh-day observing churches from the 2nd to 19th centuries explicitly documents a Wednesday crucifixion belief due to sparse records and the dominance of Friday crucifixion narratives. The Ebionites, Nazarenes, and possibly early Ethiopian Christians are the most likely candidates due to their Sabbath observance and Jewish calendrical practices, potentially aligning with the Didascalia Apostolorum's chronology. Later groups like the Waldensians and Seventh Day Baptists observed the Sabbath but lack clear evidence for a Wednesday crucifixion view. Early Adventists debated this but largely rejected it. The Wednesday crucifixion view remained a minority position, often tied to literal interpretations of Matthew 12:40, and was not consistently linked to Sabbath-observing groups.

- **Bibliography**

1. **Didascalia Apostolorum** (c. 200 CE). Translated by R. Hugh Connolly, *The Didascalia Apostolorum in English* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1929). [(<https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday>)]

2. Amadon, Grace E. "The 'Wednesday' Crucifixion Argument." **Ministry Magazine**, Takoma Park, Maryland. Accessed via [www.ministrymagazine.org.](https://www.ministrymagazine.org/) [(https://www.ministrymagazine.org/archive/1942/05/the-wednesday-crucifixion-argument)]
3. Epiphanius of Salamis. **Panarion** (c. 375 CE). Translated by Frank Williams, **The Panarion of Epiphanius of Salamis** (Leiden: Brill, 1994).
4. Eusebius of Caesarea. **Ecclesiastical History** (c. 325 CE). Translated by Kirsopp Lake, **Eusebius: Ecclesiastical History** (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1926).
5. Socrates Scholasticus. **Ecclesiastical History** (c. 439 CE). Translated by A.C. Zenos, **Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers, Second Series, Vol. 2** (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1957). [(https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday)]
6. Gregory of Tours. **History of the Franks** (c. 594 CE). Translated by Lewis Thorpe, **Gregory of Tours: History of the Franks** (London: Penguin, 1974). [(https://www.ucg.org/good-news/good-news-magazine-march-april-2006/centuries-old-documents-show-evidence-wednesday)]
7. White, Ellen G. **The Great Controversy** (1858). Reprint, Ellen G. White Estate, 2002. (For early Adventist Sabbath theology.)
8. Ball, Bryan W. **The Seventh-Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600–1800** (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1994). (For Seventh Day Baptists.)
9. Tadesse Tamrat. **Church and State in Ethiopia, 1270–1527** (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972). (For Ethiopian Church practices.)
10. Abbott, Shari. "Was Jesus Crucified on Wednesday, Thursday, or Friday?" **Reasons for Hope** Jesus, April 4, 2023. [www.reasonsforhopejesus.com.](http://www.reasonsforhopejesus.com/) [(https://reasonsforhopejesus.com/crucified/)]

- **Notes on Sources**

- **Primary Sources**: The Didascalia Apostolorum and church fathers (Epiphanius, Eusebius) provide the most direct evidence for early Christian practices but lack specificity on crucifixion day for most groups.
- **Secondary Sources**: Modern analyses (e.g., Amadon, Abbott) reflect debates but are often biased toward specific denominational views (e.g., Adventist or evangelical).
- **Gaps**: The lack of surviving texts from Sabbath-observing groups and the dominance of Roman Church records limit definitive conclusions.

Appendix. Mortality of the Soul

The belief in the mortality of the soul, often referred to as conditionalism or conditional immortality, posits that the human soul is not inherently immortal and that immortality is a gift granted by God, typically conditional upon faith in Jesus Christ. This view contrasts with the traditional Christian doctrine of the natural immortality of the soul, where the soul is believed to exist consciously after death. Conditionalism is closely related to annihilationism, which holds that the unsaved are ultimately destroyed rather than suffering eternal torment, and sometimes to soul sleep, where the dead remain unconscious until the resurrection.

Below is a list of Seventh-day Christian churches or groups from the 2nd to the 19th century that explicitly or implicitly held to the mortality of the soul (conditionalism) and rejected the immortality of the soul, based on historical evidence. The focus is on groups with a distinct seventh-day (Sabbath-keeping) practice, as specified, though such groups were rare before the 19th century due to the dominance of Sunday worship in mainstream Christianity. The list includes relevant groups, their historical context, and their theological stance on conditionalism, followed by a bibliography.

- **Seventh-day Christian Churches (2nd to 19th Century) Believing in Conditionalism**

1. **Seventh-day Adventist Church (Founded 1863, United States)**

- **Historical Context**: The Seventh-day Adventist Church emerged from the Millerite movement in the mid-19th century, following the Great Disappointment of 1844 when Jesus did not return as predicted by William Miller. The church was formally established on May 21, 1863, in Battle Creek, Michigan, with key founders including Joseph Bates, James White, and Ellen G. White. The church is distinguished by its observance of Saturday as the Sabbath and its emphasis on the imminent Second Coming of Jesus Christ.

- **Belief in Conditionalism**: Seventh-day Adventists explicitly teach conditional immortality and soul sleep, rejecting the inherent immortality of the soul. They believe that death is an unconscious state until the resurrection at Christ's second coming, based on biblical texts such as Ecclesiastes 9:5 ("the dead know nothing") and 1 Thessalonians 4:13–18 (describing the resurrection of the dead). This doctrine was formulated in the 1840s and 1850s, partly in response to the rise of spiritualism, which Adventists opposed by arguing that the dead have no conscious existence to communicate with the living. Key figures like Joseph Bates adopted conditionalism, influenced by earlier conditionalist writers such as George Storrs, who introduced the doctrine to the Millerites after reading a pamphlet by Henry Grew in 1837.

- **Evidence of Belief**: The Adventist Review notes that the doctrine of conditional immortality was solidified in the 1850s, with pioneers like Bates, James White, and Ellen G. White rejecting the immortal soul concept. Ellen White, in particular, rejected the idea in 1843, and the church's official stance holds that immortality is granted only to the righteous at the resurrection, not innate to all humans. The church's holistic view of human nature sees body, soul, and spirit as an inseparable unity, aligning with monistic anthropology.

2. **Church of God (Seventh Day) – Salem Conference (Founded 1858, United States)**

- **Historical Context**: The Church of God (Seventh Day) emerged from the same Millerite roots as the Seventh-day Adventists, with a formal organization in 1858 in Marion, Iowa. The Salem Conference, a branch of the Church of God (Seventh Day), was established later and maintained distinct theological emphases, including Sabbath observance on Saturday. This group was influenced by the broader Adventist movement but developed separately, focusing on biblical simplicity and rejecting some of the distinctive doctrines of Seventh-day Adventism (e.g., Ellen White's prophetic role).

- **Belief in Conditionalism**: The Church of God (Seventh Day) – Salem Conference holds to conditional immortality, teaching that the soul is not inherently immortal and that the dead are unconscious until the resurrection. They base this on texts like Genesis 2:7 ("man became a living soul" through God's breath) and Ezekiel 18:20 ("the soul that sins, it shall die"). The church views immortality as a gift granted to the saved at the resurrection, not an innate quality. This aligns with the conditionalist theology inherited from the Millerite movement and figures like George Storrs.

- **Evidence of Belief**: The church's doctrine reflects the broader conditionalist trend among 19th-century Adventist groups, emphasizing that the soul ceases to exist consciously at death until God resurrects the body, as supported by Psalm 146:4 ("his thoughts perish").

3. **Advent Christian Church (Founded 1860, United States)**

- **Historical Context**: The Advent Christian Church formed in the aftermath of the Millerite movement, splitting from other Adventists in the 1850s over theological differences, including conditionalism. The church was formally organized in 1860, with a strong emphasis on the Second Coming and Saturday Sabbath observance in some congregations, though not all maintained strict seventh-day practices. The Advent Christian Church was influenced by conditionalist publications like *The World's Crisis* and the work of George Storrs, who played a key role in promoting conditionalism among Millerites.

- **Belief in Conditionalism**: The Advent Christian Church adopted conditional immortality and annihilationism, teaching that the soul is mortal and that the unsaved are ultimately destroyed rather than eternally tormented. They argue that immortality is a gift given to the righteous at the resurrection, citing 1 Corinthians 15:52–53 ("the mortal must clothe itself with immortality"). The doctrine of soul sleep is also prevalent, where the dead remain unconscious until the resurrection.

- **Evidence of Belief**: The church's conditionalist stance was shaped by publications like *The Bible Advocate* and *Second Advent Watchman*, which promoted conditionalism in the 1850s. The influence of George Storrs and the formation of the Life and Advent Union in 1863 by conditionalist Millerites further solidified this belief.

● **Notes on Earlier Periods (2nd to 18th Century)**

- **Absence of Seventh-day Churches**: From the 2nd to the 18th century, there are no well-documented Christian groups that both observed the seventh-day Sabbath and explicitly held to conditional immortality. Most early Christian communities, including those in the 2nd to 7th centuries, were Sunday-worshipping and predominantly adhered to the doctrine of the immortal soul, as evidenced by the writings of early Church Fathers like Augustine and Tertullian. The Catholic Church's condemnation of soul sleep at the Fifth Council of the Lateran (1513) further entrenched the immortal soul doctrine in Western Christianity.

- **Early Conditionalist Voices**: Some early Christian writers, such as Arnobius (late 3rd century) and certain Syrian Christians (e.g., Aphrahat, Ephrem, Narsai), expressed views akin to conditionalism, emphasizing the mortality of the soul and its dependence on God for eternal life. However, these figures did not observe the seventh-day Sabbath, and their views were not associated with organized churches but rather individual theological positions. The Syrian tradition of "soul sleep in the dust" was canonized at a Nestorian synod in 786–787, but this was not linked to seventh-day worship.

- **Reformation and Beyond**: During the Reformation (16th century), figures like Martin Luther occasionally expressed views sympathetic to soul sleep, describing death as an unconscious state until the resurrection. However, Luther's views were not consistently conditionalist, and he did not advocate seventh-day Sabbath observance. Similarly, some Anabaptist groups in the 16th century explored conditionalist ideas, but no evidence suggests they were seventh-day observers. The English Dissenting Academies and early Unitarians in the 17th–18th centuries adopted conditionalism, but they were not seventh-day groups.

- **Why Limited to 19th Century?**

The scarcity of seventh-day Christian churches before the 19th century is due to the dominance of Sunday worship in both Western and Eastern Christianity after the 4th century, following the Council of Laodicea (363–364), which mandated Sunday observance. Conditionalism, while present in minority voices (e.g., Arnobius, some Syriac Christians, and later Reformation figures like John Wycliffe and William Tyndale), was not typically associated with seventh-day Sabbath-keeping until the Millerite movement in the 19th century. The Millerites, though not all seventh-day observers, laid the groundwork for conditionalist theology in groups like the Seventh-day Adventists, influenced by George Storrs and Henry Grew.

- **Bibliography**

Bacchiocchi, Samuele. *Immortality or Resurrection? A Biblical Study on Human Nature and Destiny*. Berrien Springs, Michigan: Biblical Perspectives, 1997. ISBN 1-930987-12-9.

Ball, Bryan W. *The Soul Sleepers: Christian Mortalism from Wycliffe to Priestley*. Cambridge: James Clarke & Co., 2008.

Froom, Le Roy. *The Conditionalist Faith of Our Fathers*, 2 vols. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1965–1966.

Grant, Miles. *Positive Theology*. Boston: Advent Christian Publication Society, 1895.

Knight, George R. *A Brief History of Seventh-day Adventists*. Hagerstown, MD: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1999.

Pool, J. Lawrence. *Against Returning to Egypt: Exposing and Resisting Credalism in the Southern Baptist Convention*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1998.

White, Edward. *Life in Christ: A Study of the Scripture Doctrine on the Nature of Man, the Object of the Divine Incarnation, and the Conditions of Human Immortality*. London: E. Stock, 1846.

“Christian Conditionalism.” *Wikipedia*, last modified October 14, 2005. Accessed May 24, 2025. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_conditionalism.
[](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_conditionalism)

“Christian Mortalism.” *Wikipedia*, last modified August 15, 2003. Accessed May 24, 2025. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_mortalism.
[](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Christian_mortalism)

“The Dead Are Really Dead.” *Adventist Review*, published June 2, 2021. Accessed May 24, 2025. <https://adventistreview.org/magazine-article/the-dead-are-really-dead/>.
[](<https://adventistreview.org/magazine-article/2106-50/>)

“Seventh-day Adventist Church.” *Wikipedia*, last modified October 25, 2001. Accessed May 24, 2025. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church.
[](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church)

“Annihilationism.” *Wikipedia*, last modified March 12, 2004. Accessed May 24, 2025. <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Annihilationism>.
[](<https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Annihilationism>)

- **Additional Notes**

- **Millerite Influence**: While the Millerites (1833–1844) were not a seventh-day church, their adoption of conditionalism through George Storrs was pivotal for later seventh-day groups like the Seventh-day Adventists and Advent Christians. William Miller himself did not believe in conditional immortality, but many in his movement did.
- **Historical Gaps**: No clear evidence exists of seventh-day Christian churches in the 2nd to 18th centuries that held to conditionalism. The doctrine was more common among non-Sabbatarian groups like early Unitarians or certain Baptists, but these did not observe the seventh-day Sabbath.
- **Theological Nuance**: Conditionalism often overlaps with soul sleep and annihilationism, but not all conditionalists deny an intermediate state entirely. For example, Edward White (1846) posited a conscious intermediate state, which deviates from the standard Adventist view of unconsciousness.

Appendix. Divinisation

The doctrine of divinization, deification, or *theosis*—the belief that humans can partake in the divine nature or become "gods" through God's grace—has a complex history within Christianity. It was most prominently articulated in Eastern Orthodox theology but also appeared in certain Western traditions. However, identifying specific "Seventh Day Christian churches" (i.e., those observing the Sabbath on Saturday) that explicitly held this belief between the 2nd and 19th centuries is challenging due to limited historical evidence of Sabbath-keeping groups consistently emphasizing *theosis* during this period. Most Sabbath-keeping Christian groups, when they emerged, were more focused on eschatology, Sabbath observance, and other distinctives rather than deification.

Below, I provide a response that outlines the historical context, identifies potential Sabbath-keeping groups that may have intersected with deification theology, and notes the scarcity of direct evidence linking the two. I also include a bibliography for further research. The response is structured to address the query comprehensively while acknowledging gaps in the historical record.

- **Historical Context**

Divinization/Theosis in Early Christianity

The doctrine of *theosis* was developed early in Christian theology, particularly by the Greek Church Fathers. It is rooted in biblical passages like Psalm 82:6 ("I said, 'You are gods, sons of the Most High'") and 2 Peter 1:4 ("partakers of the divine nature"). Key figures like Irenaeus (c. 130–202), Clement of Alexandria (c. 150–215), Athanasius (c. 296–373), and Gregory of Nazianzus (c. 329–390) articulated deification as a transformative process where humans, through Christ's incarnation and grace, could share in God's divine attributes without losing their distinct human nature. This doctrine was central to Eastern Orthodoxy but less emphasized in Western Christianity, where it was often framed differently (e.g., as union with God rather than explicit deification). (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29) (https://www.fairlatterdaysaints.org/evidences/Early_Christian_Deification_Belief)

****Seventh Day Christian Churches****

Sabbath-keeping Christian groups (those observing the seventh day, Saturday, as the Sabbath) were rare and often marginalized in the early and medieval Christian world. The dominant Christian tradition, especially after the 4th century, shifted to Sunday worship, and Sabbath-keeping groups were often labeled as Judaizing and suppressed. Groups like the Paulicians, Waldenses, and later Sabbatarian Anabaptists maintained seventh-day Sabbath observance but were not consistently linked to **theosis**. The Seventh-day Adventist Church, which emerged in the 19th century, is the most prominent modern Sabbath-keeping denomination, but its theology does not emphasize deification. [\[\]\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church) [\[\]\(https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content\)](https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content)

****Intersection of Sabbath-Keeping and Deification****

The doctrine of **theosis** was most robust in Eastern Orthodoxy, which generally observed Sunday as the Lord's Day. Sabbath-keeping groups, when they existed, were often in Western or marginal contexts, where deification was less emphasized due to theological differences (e.g., Augustine's stress on God's transcendence in the West). Thus, finding groups that explicitly combined seventh-day Sabbath observance with a belief in deification is difficult, as these doctrines tended to develop in separate theological streams. Below, I list groups that were Sabbath-keeping or had Sabbath-keeping factions and explore any potential connections to deification based on available evidence.

• List of Seventh Day Christian Churches (2nd to 19th Century) and Their Relation to Divinization/Deification

1. **Paulicians (7th–9th Century)**

- ****Description****: The Paulicians were a dualist Christian sect in Armenia and the Byzantine Empire, often considered heretical by the Orthodox Church. They emphasized a return to early Christian practices, including, according to some sources, observing the seventh-day Sabbath. They were influenced by Gnostic and Adoptionist ideas, rejecting certain Orthodox doctrines. [\[\]\(https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content\)](https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content)

- ****Connection to Deification****: There is little direct evidence that the Paulicians taught **theosis** in the Eastern Orthodox sense. Their dualist theology, which distinguished sharply between the material and spiritual realms, likely conflicted with the incarnational theology underpinning deification (i.e., the belief that Christ's incarnation unites human and divine natures). Their focus was more on asceticism and rejection of ecclesiastical hierarchy than on mystical union with God. However, their emphasis on spiritual purity could loosely align with the **katharsis** (purification) stage of **theosis**.

[\[\]\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)

- ****Evidence****: Ananias of Shirak (7th century) notes their Sabbath-keeping practices, and some scholars suggest they preserved early Jewish-Christian traditions. However, their surviving texts do not emphasize deification. [\[\]\(https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content\)](https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content)

2. **Waldenses (12th–16th Century)**

- ****Description****: The Waldenses, a proto-Protestant movement founded by Peter Waldo in the 12th century, emphasized biblical simplicity and rejected many Catholic practices. Some Waldensian groups were called **Insabbatati** or **Sabbatati**, possibly indicating seventh-day Sabbath observance, though

this is debated. They faced persecution and were primarily active in southern France and northern Italy.

[(<https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content>)

- **Connection to Deification**: The Waldenses focused on moral purity, scripture-based faith, and rejection of Catholic sacramentalism, which included elements of Latin liturgy that referenced deification (e.g., in baptismal rites). There is no clear evidence they taught *theosis*, as their theology leaned toward practical piety rather than mystical transformation. However, their emphasis on imitating Christ's holiness could resonate with the moral aspects of deification. [(https://www.academia.edu/50829080/_Turning_Worshippers_into_Gods_Deification_in_the_Latin_Liturgy_)

- **Evidence**: Historian J.N. Andrews cites sources like Goldastus and Archbishop Ussher, who suggest some Waldenses observed the Jewish Sabbath, but deification is not mentioned in their surviving teachings. [(<https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content>)

3. **Sabbatarian Anabaptists (16th–17th Century)**

- **Description**: Emerging during the Radical Reformation, Sabbatarian Anabaptists in Germany, Poland, Hungary, and Romania (e.g., led by figures like Oswald Glaidt and Andreas Fischer) observed the seventh-day Sabbath and rejected infant baptism. They were influenced by a restorationist desire to return to biblical practices. [(<https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content>)

- **Connection to Deification**: There is no direct evidence that Sabbatarian Anabaptists taught deification. Their theology focused on obedience to biblical law, adult baptism, and eschatology. However, their emphasis on spiritual transformation through repentance and holy living could align with the preparatory stages of *theosis* (e.g., *katharsis*). Their rejection of Trinitarian orthodoxy in some cases may have distanced them from the incarnational theology central to deification. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)

- **Evidence**: Andrews' *History of the Sabbath and First Day of the Week* documents their Sabbath observance, but deification is not addressed in their writings. [(<https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content>)

4. **Ethiopian Orthodox Church (Tewahedo) (4th Century Onward)**

- **Description**: The Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church, part of Oriental Orthodoxy, has historically observed the seventh-day Sabbath alongside Sunday worship, influenced by Jewish traditions in Ethiopia. This practice dates back to at least the 4th century and continues in some forms today. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_Christianity)

- **Connection to Deification**: As an Oriental Orthodox Church, the Ethiopian Church shares theological roots with Eastern Orthodoxy, including a belief in *theosis*. Their liturgy and theology emphasize union with God through the sacraments, particularly the Eucharist, and ascetic practices, aligning with the three-stage process of *theosis* (*katharsis*, *theoria*, *theosis*). This makes them a rare example of a Sabbath-observing tradition with a clear deification theology. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theosis_%28Eastern_Christian_theology%29)

- **Evidence**: The Ethiopian Church's liturgical texts and practices, as noted in studies of Oriental Orthodoxy, reflect *theosis* as a central soteriological concept. Their Sabbath observance is documented in historical accounts of Ethiopian Christianity. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/History_of_Christianity)

5. **Seventh Day Baptists (17th Century Onward)**

- **Description**: Emerging in England in the mid-17th century, Seventh Day Baptists were a Protestant group that emphasized seventh-day Sabbath observance. They influenced later groups like the Seventh-day Adventists. [\[\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church)
- **Connection to Deification**: Seventh Day Baptists focused on biblical literalism, Sabbath-keeping, and evangelical doctrines, with no clear evidence of teaching *theosis*. Their theology was rooted in Western Protestantism, which generally downplayed deification in favor of justification and sanctification. Any connection to deification would be indirect, through their emphasis on holy living. [\[\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)
- **Evidence**: Historical records of Seventh Day Baptists (e.g., in denominational histories) focus on Sabbath observance and do not mention deification. [\[\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church)

- **Challenges and Notes**

- **Scarcity of Direct Evidence**: Most Sabbath-keeping groups in this period were either small, persecuted, or poorly documented, making it difficult to confirm their stance on deification. The doctrine of *theosis* was most developed in Eastern Orthodoxy, which typically did not observe the seventh-day Sabbath, while Sabbath-keeping groups were often Western or marginal and focused on different theological priorities.
- **Ethiopian Exception**: The Ethiopian Orthodox Church stands out as a Sabbath-observing tradition with a clear belief in *theosis*, due to its Oriental Orthodox theology. This is the strongest candidate for meeting your criteria.
- **19th-Century Context**: The Seventh-day Adventist Church, formed in 1863, does not teach deification, focusing instead on eschatology and Sabbath observance. Earlier Sabbath-keeping groups like the Waldenses or Sabbatarian Anabaptists similarly lack explicit deification teachings. [\[\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church)
- **Theological Divergence**: Deification requires a robust theology of the incarnation, which was less emphasized in Western traditions where many Sabbath-keeping groups emerged. Eastern Orthodox theology, with its mystical and sacramental focus, was more conducive to *theosis*. [\[\(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)

- **Bibliography**

1. Andrews, J.N. *History of the Sabbath and First Day of the Week*. Battle Creek, MI: Review and Herald Publishing, 1873.
 - A key source for Sabbath-keeping groups, particularly the Waldenses and Sabbatarian Anabaptists. [\[\(https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content\)](https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content)
2. Gross, Jules. *The Divinisation of the Christian According to the Greek Fathers*. Paris: Gabalda, 1938 (English translation, 2000).
 - A comprehensive study of deification in early Greek Patristic theology. [\[\(https://eom.byu.edu/index.php/Deification%2C_Early_Christian\)\]](https://eom.byu.edu/index.php/Deification%2C_Early_Christian) [\[\(https://byustudies.byu.edu/article/the-doctrine-of-deification-in-the-greek-patristic-tradition/\)\]](https://byustudies.byu.edu/article/the-doctrine-of-deification-in-the-greek-patristic-tradition/)
3. Haws, J.B. "Defenders of the Doctrine of Deification." In *Prelude to the Restoration: From Apostasy to the Restored Church*, 70–98. Provo, UT: Religious Studies Center, Brigham Young University, 2004.

- Discusses deification in Eastern Orthodoxy and its parallels with LDS theology. [(https://rsc.byu.edu/prelude-restoration/defenders-doctrine-deification)]
- 4. Norman, Keith E. "Deification: The Content of Athanasian Soteriology." Ph.D. dissertation, Duke University, 1980.
 - Examines deification in Athanasius and early Christian thought. [(https://eom.byu.edu/index.php/Deification%2C_Early_Christian)]
- 5. Ortiz, Jared. "Making Worshipers into Gods: Deification in the Latin Liturgy." **Church History: Studies in Christianity and Culture**, 2019.
 - Explores deification in Western liturgical traditions, particularly in baptismal rites. [(https://www.academia.edu/50829080/_Turning_Worshipers_into_Gods_Deification_in_the_Latin_Liturgy_)]
- 6. Russell, Norman. **The Doctrine of Deification in the Greek Patristic Tradition**. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
 - A definitive study of deification in Eastern Christianity through the 7th century. [(https://byustudies.byu.edu/article/the-doctrine-of-deification-in-the-greek-patristic-tradition/)]
- 7. Stavropoulos, Christoforos. **Partakers of Divine Nature**. Athens: Light and Life Publishing, 1976.
 - A modern Eastern Orthodox perspective on **theosis**. [(https://rsc.byu.edu/prelude-restoration/defenders-doctrine-deification)]
- 8. Conybeare, F.C. **The Key of Truth: A Manual of the Paulician Church of Armenia**. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1898.
 - Provides historical background on Paulician practices, including Sabbath observance. [(https://www.tomorrowworld.org/booklets/gods-church-through-the-ages/content)]
- 9. Pelikan, Jaroslav. **The Christian Tradition: A History of the Development of Doctrine, Vols. 1–2**. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1971–1974.
 - Covers the development of Christian doctrines, including deification. [(https://eom.byu.edu/index.php/Deification%2C_Early_Christian)]
- 10. "Divinization (Christian)." **Wikipedia**, last modified 2024. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_\(Christian\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_(Christian)).
 - A general overview of deification in Christian theology. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)] [(https://en.m.wikipedia.org/wiki/Divinization_%28Christian%29)]
- 11. "Seventh-day Adventist Church." **Wikipedia**, last modified 2024. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church.
 - Details the history and theology of the Seventh-day Adventist Church. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Seventh-day_Adventist_Church)]
- 12. "Theosis (Eastern Christian Theology)." **Wikipedia**, last modified 2024. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theosis_\(Eastern_Christian_theology\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theosis_(Eastern_Christian_theology)).
 - Discusses **theosis** in Eastern Orthodox and Eastern Catholic traditions. [(https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Theosis_%28Eastern_Christian_theology%29)]

• Conclusion

The Ethiopian Orthodox Tewahedo Church is the most prominent example of a seventh-day Sabbath-observing Christian group that explicitly taught deification, due to its Oriental Orthodox theology. Other Sabbath-keeping groups like the Paulicians, Waldenses, and Sabbatarian Anabaptists may have had theological elements (e.g., holiness, spiritual transformation) that loosely align with **theosis**, but there is no direct evidence they emphasized deification. The scarcity of records and the theological divergence between Eastern (deification-focused) and Western (Sabbath-focused) traditions limit definitive connections. For further research, I recommend exploring primary sources from the Ethiopian Church and Patristic writings on **theosis** (e.g., Irenaeus, Athanasius) alongside histories of Sabbath-keeping groups. If you need specific primary source excerpts or deeper analysis of any group, please let me know!

Endnotes

¹ “Whatever happened to the Hebrew Christians?” *The Economist*, 20 April 2011.

² B Blackwell, <https://dunelm.wordpress.com/2019/02/08/theophilus-of-antioch-and-theosis/>

³ “Theophilus of Antioch. To Autolytus, Book II, Chapter XXII.” Translated by Marcus Dods, A.M. Excerpted from *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 2, 1885.

⁴ “... “Nazarene” Christianity [Sabbatarians and adherers to the Law], had a view of Jesus fully compatible with the beliefs favored by the proto-orthodox (indeed, they could be considered part of the circles that made up proto-orthodox Christianity of the time). Pritz contended that this **Nazarene Christianity was the dominant form of Christianity in the first and second centuries** ... the devotional stance toward Jesus that characterized most of the Jewish Christians of the first and second centuries seems to have been congruent with proto-orthodox devotion to Jesus ... **the proto-orthodox “binitarian” pattern of devotion**” (LW Hurtado, *Lord Jesus Christ, Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity*, pp. 560-61, 618).

As such, they did not view the holy spirit as a personage. One author explains it in this fashion:

“The Nazarene doctrine of the Holy Spirit, though it may have been somewhat primitive and underdeveloped, was not heretical. Even the greater Church’s doctrine of the Holy Spirit took significantly longer than the other doctrines to develop not reaching its final form until the fourth or fifth century. That the Nazarene doctrine of the Holy Spirit might have been somewhat primitive compared to that of the greater Church would not be unexpected. The increasing isolation of the Nazarenes would have cut them off from the deliberations and decisions of the greater Church on this issue, accounting for the retarded development of this doctrine among the Nazarenes.” (K Howard, *Excommunicating the Faithful. Jewish Christianity in the Early Church*, footnote 417)

This shows that both Sabbatarians and the neo-Catholic groups did not adhere to the trinitarian formula at that time – it came into Christianity gradually.

Further information on the Nazarene’s binitarian belief can be found in the article *Are the Nazarenes and Ebionites the only True Christians?*

⁵ Belief in three (instead of two) resurrections is virtually unheard of in Christian theology. However, history records that some Sabbatarians believed in three resurrections in the 2nd century:

“These Jewish Christian groups, referred to by Epiphanius (Williams, 1987) as Nazarenes or Elkasaites, professed the following beliefs: They proclaimed Jesus as prophet-Messiah; insisted upon the validity of the Torah & laws of ritual purity; **spoke of three resurrections**; professed a **millennarian eschatology**; looked forward to the restoration of the Temple; observed the feast of Sukkoth (Tabernacles), celebrated Easter at Passover, & observed the Sabbath; affirmed the primacy of James, brother of Jesus, over Peter in the leadership of the church; & preferred the

designation "Nazarene" over "Christian." (E Meyers, "Early Judaism and Christianity in the Light of Archaeology," *Biblical Archaeologist*, June 1988, p. 71) [emphasis mine]

If it is indeed true that the Nazarenes are our spiritual ancestors (Acts 24:5), it would appear from the above quote that they believed in 3 resurrections. One can assume that they believed in three resurrections in similitude to what the old Worldwide Church of God taught (viz 1st resurrection of the saints; 2nd resurrection of the majority of mankind who were not 'called' to salvation in this life; 3rd resurrection to eternal death of the wicked). Alternatively, they may have meant that Christ's resurrection was the 1st, the resurrection of the saints was the 2nd and the resurrection at the end of the millennium was the 3rd. More investigation is required in this regard to ascertain with certainty exactly what they believed pertaining to the 3rd resurrection. It may be more than passing interest that there were:

- 3 resurrections performed in the Old Testament (IKings 17:17-25; IIKings 4:32-37; 13:20-21);
- 3 by Christ (Luke 7:11-18; Mark 5:35; John 11); and
- 3 after Christ's death (Matt 27:51-53; Acts 9:36-43; 20:7-16).

⁶ D Rogers, *The Historic Phenomena and Theology of the Nazarenes and Ebionites*, p. 14.

⁷ "Nazarenes," *The Encyclopaedia Britannica*, Eleventh Edition, Vol. 19.

⁸ B Bagatti, *The Church from the Circumcision. History and Archaeology of the Judaeo-Christians*, pp. 13-14.

⁹ P Frederickson, *When Christians Were Jews: The First Generation*, p. 100.

¹⁰ W Cook, "The Ebionites: Eccentric or Essential Early Christians?" *Journal of Arts and Humanities*, Vol. 2, No. 7, August 2013, pp. 15-22.

¹¹ J Starr, "An Eastern Christian Sect: the Athinganoi," *The Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. xxix, No. 2, April 1936, p. 96.

¹² F Conybeare, *The Key of Truth: A Manual of the Paulician Church of Armenia* (pp. 127, 149). He further noted: "The general impression which the study of it leaves on us is that in it we have before us a form of Church not very remote from the primitive Jewish Christianity of Palestine ... they were probably the remnant of an old Judeo-Christian Church, which had spread up through Edessa into Siuniq and Albania" (pp. clii, cxcii, clxii).

In addition, Nina Garsoïan stated that they were "**accused of being worse than other sects because of adding Judaism**" (*The Paulician Heresy*, p. 213) [emphasis mine]. She contests the conventional perspective that categorized Paulicians as Manichaeans or Gnostics, underscoring their origins in a reformist Christian movement. Garsoïan's research emphasises that these allegations were frequently overstated by adversaries to depict the Paulicians as heretics, associating them with Judaizing groups to rationalize persecution.

¹³ W Wakefield, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 175.

¹⁴ B Ball, "The roots of English sabbatarianism." In B. Ball, & R. Mclver (Eds.), *Grounds for assurance and hope: Selected biblical and historical writings of Bryan W. Ball*, pp. 147-48. See Mosheim (et al) *An Ecclesiastical History*, p. 333: "the denomination of the *Pasaginians* ... The first was a notion, that the observance of the law of Moses, in everything except the offering of sacrifices, was obligatory upon Christians; in consequence of which they circumcised their followers, **abstained from those meats, the use**

of which was prohibited under the Mosaic economy, and celebrated the Jewish sabbath. The second tenet that distinguished this sect was advanced in **opposition to the doctrine of three persons** in the divine nature.”

¹⁵ Blunt's *Dictionary of Sects and Heresies*, quoted in Blackwell, *A Handbook of Church History*, pp. 115-116.

¹⁶ *Collectio Rev. Occitan* in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers' *History of the Sects*, Vol. 2, p. 375

“After what has been said of the Cathari, there still remains the sect of the Pasagini. **They teach Christ to be the first and pure creature; that the Old Testament festivals are to be observed-- circumcision, distinction of foods**, and in nearly all other matters, save the sacrifices, the Old Testament is to be observed as literally as the New-- circumcision is to be kept according to the letter.” (*Collectio Rev. Occitan* in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers' *History of the Sects*, Vol. 2 p. 375 quoted in <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians>).

Also, “The Pasagians, also spelled Passagians or Pasagini, were a religious sect which appeared in Lombardy in the late 12th or early 13th century and possibly appearing much earlier in the East. The *Summa contra haereticos*, ascribed to Praepositinus of Cremona, describes the Pasagians as retaining the Old Testament rules on circumcision, **kosher foods, and the Jewish holy days; in other words, they observed the Law of Moses except in respect to sacrifices**, and thus also were given the name Circumcisi.” (Blunt, John Henry (1874). *Dictionary of Sects, Heresies, Ecclesiastical Parties and Schools of Religious Thought*. London, Oxford and Cambridge: Rivingtons, pp. 408-09. quoted in <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians>).

Of these, Johann Lorenz Mosheim has written the following:

"Like the other sects already mentioned, they had the utmost aversion to the dominion and discipline of the church of Rome; but they were, at the same time, distinguished by two religious tenets, which were peculiar to themselves. The first was a notion that the observation of the law of Moses, in everything except the offering of sacrifices, was obligatory upon Christians, in consequence of which they circumcised their followers, abstained from those meats, the use of which was prohibited under the Mosaic economy, and celebrated the Jewish Sabbath" (*Ecclesiastical History*, Vol. 2, p. 273, 1860 edition).

¹⁷ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, p. 33.

¹⁸ *The Book of Antichrist* published by the Waldenses (c1182) – referred to in Robert Baird, *History of the Ancient Christians Inhabiting the Valley of the Alps*, p. 470.

¹⁹ P Damsteegt, “Decoding Waldensian Names: New Discoveries,” *Andrews University Seminary Studies*, Vol. 54, No. 2, 2016, pp. 252-57.

Peter Allix, wrote about the doctrines of some of the Waldensians based on a critic of theirs:

“That the Law of Moses is to be kept according to the letter, and that the keeping of the Sabbath, Circumcision, **and other legal observances**, ought to take place. They hold also, **that Christ the Son of God is not equal with the Father, and that the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, these three Persons, are not one God** and one substance; and, as a surplus to these their errors, -they judge and condemn all the doctors of the Church, and universally the whole Roman Church. Now, since they endeavour to defend this their error by testimonies drawn from the New Testament and Prophets, I shall, with assistance of the grace of Christ, stop their mouths, as David did Goliath's, with their own sword. (*Some Remarks upon the Ecclesiastical History of the Ancient churches of Piedmont*, p. 169)

²⁰ W Bacher, “The Sabbatarians of Hungary,” *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 2, 1 July 1890, p. 473.

²¹ <http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html>

After he died, Eossi's adopted son, Simon Pechi, took over the movement it is reported that 20,000 Hungarians to the faith until a crackdown occurred and many fled, left the faith or converted to Judaism. Legislation was passed in 1595 and 1618 decreeing death or loss of property for all Judaizers.

²² J Gellerd, "Spiritual Jews of Szekler Jerusalem," *Literature of Memory VI: Hope and Despair*, STH TS 870, Fall, p. 2.

Mention is made of these East European sabbatarians in the *Ambassador College Bible Correspondence Course*, lesson 52, pp. 12-13.

²³ D Liechty, "Andreas Fischer: A Brief Biographical Sketch," *The Mennonite Quarterly Review*, April 1984, pp. 131-32.

²⁴ W White, *The Roots of Our Belief*. Dynamic Christian Ministries, USA, 2008, pp. 6-7. His source is probably Leon Lyell's article "The Seventh Day Men," *The Sabbath Sentinel*, July-Aug (2000), pp. 13-16.

²⁵ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, p. 94.

²⁶ F Herrmann, "Antinomians, Ceremonialists, and Judaizers: on the Margins of Puritanism?" *French Journal of British Studies*, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 2022, p 53.

²⁷ F Herrmann, *ibid*, p. 53.

²⁸ J Falconer, a Roman Catholic priest: "By reading in Eusebius history lib. 1. cap. 22. how Saint Policarpe and other holy Bishops of Asia observed the lewes time of keeping Easter, he and his disciples are lately therein resolved to imitate them. ... seemeth falsely to suppose, and Maister Cra. his Aduersary as lightly to graunt, that a Sabaoth, or seauenth daie of rest from bodily labour was from the beginning of mans Creation ... Christians are expressly forbidden to play the lewes, and to be idle on the Sabaoth, and willed with all to obserue and prefer our Lords day before it ... the 14. of March-moone, wherein the lewes were commaunded by God to celebrate their Passouer. And vpon his late reading in Eusebius lib 5. hist. cap. 22. Policrates epistle directed to Victor Bishop of Rome concerning the Asian custome of keeping easter with the lews, ... he will arrogantly presume to call Victor that holy Bishop & Mar|tyr, famously mentioned in ancient histories, a proud Prelate, ... he hath ob|serued the feast of Azimes, ... the ancient Bishop of Ephesus in a preposterous zeale of obseruing the yearly me|emory of our Sauieurs resurrection, as S. Policarpe and other great Saintes had done before him in those partes of Asia, wrote very earnestly in the defence of that Quartadeciman Custome. Whose authority hath, as it should seeme, much moued Iohn Traske ... IOHN Traske and his disciples hold the Legall difference of meates mentioned Leuit. 11. Deutron. 10. to be so morall in it selfe" (pp. 3, 17, 21, 43, 57-58 ,60, 65)

²⁹ F Herrmann, *ibid*, pp. 52, 57.

³⁰ F Herrmann, *ibid*, p. 57.

³¹ Aidan Cottrell-Boyce, *Jewish Christians in Puritan England*, pp. 183, 188.

³² B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, pp. 89-91.

³³ L Froom, *The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers*, Vol. 4, p. 913.

³⁴ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, p. 89.

³⁵ *Confession of Faith* by Samuel Ward (5 August 1769) quoted in <https://www.ucg.org/the-good-news/governor-samuel-ward-and-his-confession-of-faith>

³⁶ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, pp. 9-10.

³⁷ L Briggs, *What Became of the Church Jesus Built?* p. 206.

³⁸ G Dellinger, *A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine*, pp. 11-12.

³⁹ L Briggs, *What Became of the Church Jesus Built?* p. 206.

⁴⁰ H Clarke, *A History of the Sabbatarians or Seventh Day Baptists in America*, p. 62.

⁴¹ R Nickels, *History of the Seventh Day Church of God* (Vol. 1), p. 187.

⁴² K Stump, "The Origins of the Church of God's Oldest Publication — The Bible Advocate," *Reviews You Can Use*, Jan-Feb 1994, p. 18.

⁴³ "I find in our files that there was a critical minister, a David Nield said to be the pastor of the Church of God at Devonport, Halloway, London North, England, Auckland and Wellington, New Zealand, author of the Good Friday Problem which proves that Christ died on Wednesday and rose on Saturday" (Arthur L. White, *Ellen G. White Estate – Question and Answer File*, 13 May, 1965, p. 1, Secretary, Ellen G. White Publications).

"Nield was known as a pastor of the Church of God and not sympathetic to the Adventist cause. He held such beliefs as a Wednesday crucifixion of Christ, the continuing necessity to celebrate the Passover He challenged the Pitcairners to give up Adventism and accept his teachings as his wife had done. Instead, the islanders refused and despatched an urgent request to Australia for a resident Adventist missionary." (by Milton Hook, *Sequel to a Mutiny Early Adventism on Pitcairn Island*, South Pacific Division Department of Education, Wairoa, c.1980, p. 16).

"From its low ebb the fervour on Pitcairn soared to a high peak during those eight months of 1924. News then came to hand that Nield had died in New Zealand and the Hares left Pitcairn on October 23." (p. 17).

[emphasis mine for all references above]